

2026

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission (TPCHC)
Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS)

LEGAL ACTION REPORT/Minutes

Thursday, March 26, 2026

This was a virtual meeting. The meeting was accessible at the link provided to allow for participating in-person, virtually, and/or calling in.

Note: A recording of the entire meeting (audio/video) can be accessed at <https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLUfRGd7RxAUv6rMbRNEurjg1iY8N4ZALR>

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

The meeting was called to order at 1:00 p.m., and per roll call, a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present (all virtual): Teresita Majewski (Chair), Andrew Christopher, Blake Houghton, Joel Ireland (joined at 1:03 p.m.), and Savannah McDonald (left at 3:03 p.m.).

Commissioners Absent: None

Applicants/Public Present (all virtual): Demion Clinco (CEO Tucson Historic Preservation Foundation); Sadie Shaw, Yu Yu Shiratori, and Wylwyn Reyes (Arts Foundation for Tucson and Southern Arizona); Robert B. Otero and Roman Sainz (Casa de Otero, 746 S. Osborne Ave.); Anne Lopez and Jim Glock (Arts Foundation for Tucson and Southern Arizona, Public Art and Community Design Committee, Deaccession Subcommittee); Eric Barrett (ARC Studios Inc, 181 W. Broadway Blvd.), Teresa Vasquez (HSL Properties, 181 W. Broadway Blvd.), Tim Smith (Swaim Associates Architects, 181 W. Broadway Blvd.), Rachel Hink (University of Arizona Architecture and Urban Planning Student), Gabriel Vargas (GGV Designs, 212 E. 17th)

Staff Present (all virtual): Desiree Aranda, Maria Gayosso, Jason Lilienthal, and Sarah Meggison (City of Tucson Planning and Development Services Department [PDSD])

2. Review and approval of 3/12/2026 Legal Action Reports (LAR) and Meeting Minutes

Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner Houghton moved to approve the Legal Action Report/Minutes for the meeting of 3/12/2026 as submitted.

Commissioner McDonald seconded the motion.

No discussion was held.

The motion passed unanimously 5-0.

3. Summary of Public Comments (Information Only)

Staff Aranda noted a letter was received from the Tucson Historic Preservation Foundation (THPF) related to item 5b, 181 W. Broadway Boulevard. Chair Majewski stated the comments would be shared during the item's discussion later in the agenda.

**4. Turnkey sculptures by Charles Alfred Clement
949 E 35th St (Parcel #129133250)**

Discussion

The Tucson Historic Preservation Foundation (THPF) requests a recommendation on the eligibility/ineligibility of the Turnkey sculptures for listing in the National Register of Historic Places or as a local Tucson historic landmark. The Turnkey sculptures are public art created by Charles Alfred Clement and commissioned by the City of Tucson in 1969 for a federally funded public housing development. The Turnkey sculptures were deinstalled and relocated to a different site between 1995 and 2006. The question of historic eligibility is part of a broader conversation related to the potential relocation or deaccession of the Turnkey sculptures, which are part of the City of Tucson Public Art Collection. Presentation will include review of the initial THPF request, Public Art & Community Design Committee (PACDC) oversight process as it pertains to the City of Tucson's Administrative Directives 7-01-07, and status of the Relocation Deaccession committee.

Staff Contact: Desiree Aranda, Historic Preservation Officer

Staff Aranda provided background and Mr. Clinco of the THPF presented the history of the Turnkey sculptures, integrity considerations, and proposed relocation of the sculptures. Jim Glock and Anne Lopez from the Arts Foundation for Tucson and Southern Arizona, Public Art and Community Design Committee Deaccession Subcommittee and Yu Yu Shiratori from the Arts Foundation for Tucson and Southern Arizona provided additional background.

Commissioner comments included the following:

- Commissioner Houghton shared comments from the Historic Landscapes Subcommittee of the TPCHC, which previously reviewed the proposal. He noted that HLS agreed the sculptures are significant but lack integrity as a collection. We can't preserve them because they've been removed from their original location, and we can't take them back to the site. Some sculptures have been lost or damaged. Rehabilitating the sculptures by recommending the approval of this proposal (deaccession to the THPF) is the only thing they can do to respect the artist's intent to respect these sculptures in and of themselves.
- Commissioner Christopher agreed largely with Blake's assessment. The only way to rehabilitate them is to bring them back together as a collection although incomplete, and to reassociate them with Charles Clement; but he does have major equity concerns about moving them from an underresourced part of town to a private residence. He wondered if there is an alternative location if the City can still steward them. There are multiple public housing projects that are being built and it may be more appropriate to relocate to a public housing project to address the equity concern. It is clear that the city has not been good stewards and knows that the THFP would be excellent stewards. If

they do go to THPF, he encourages that the sculptures be displayed in the front yard of the Bondante House.

- Commissioner McDonald loves the idea of collecting them and bringing them together. Has concerns about removal from that particular location in town. Likes the idea that if the City is building housing projects, it's a good idea to put them closer to their original location.
- Commissioner Ireland has hesitation about removing them from disadvantaged areas and putting public art in private hands troubles him.
- Chair Majewski stated the sculptures lack integrity as individual objects. Unless they are reassociated together, taken care of, preserved and rehabilitated and linked back to their significance and integrity as a unit, they will be presented in a way that was not the intent of the creator; there is a responsibility to care for these works.

5. Historic Preservation Zone (HPZ) Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

- a. **SD-0225-00018/TC-RES-0423-04425** **Action**
746 S Osborne Avenue (Parcel #11714383G, 11714383C, 11714383E)
Garage and 2nd dwelling addition, existing buildings renovation. This item was continued from the August 28, 2025, PRS meeting. PRS may recommend approval, approval with conditions, or denial of the application.
Full Review/Barrio Historico HPZ
Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards
Staff Contact: Desiree Aranda, Historic Preservation Officer

Staff Lilienthal provided background and introduced the applicants, Roman Sainz and Robert Otero, who presented the project. Commissioners asked questions and discussed the project.

Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner McDonald moved to recommend approval with conditions:

1. The applicant is to provide a design solution for the drainage at the north elevation to be reviewed and approved by the historic preservation office.
2. Update the elevations in the drawing set to notate the correct materials.

Commissioner Ireland seconded the motion.

No discussion was held.

The motion passed unanimously 5-0.

- b. **SD-0326-00035/TD-DEV-0126-00003** **Action**
181 W Broadway Blvd (Parcel #11720019C, 11720019B)
The proposed project is to restore and renovate the existing 14-story hotel building. The scope includes providing increased universal accessibility to the building and to

the adjacent Historic Plaza, improve energy efficiency of the building envelope, and addresses code/life safety limitations to bring the hotel back into a functional state. The existing building will be renovated on the exterior including replacing the doors and windows, restoring the metal panels and stucco areas, and replacing the roofing. Project includes new landscape and hardscape features. The building is not listed on local or National Registers but is located within the Rio Nuevo Area (RNA), and a portion of the project area overlaps with the National Register-listed Tucson Community Center Historic Landscape. The Historic Landscapes Subcommittee (HLS) of TPCCHC conducted a courtesy review for the project on December 18, 2025, and March 25, 2026. PRS conducted a courtesy review for the project on January 8, 2026. PRS may recommend approval, approval with conditions, or denial of the application.

*Full Review/Rio Nuevo Area (RNA) and Tucson Community Center Historic Landscape National Register Historic District
Contributing Resource (Landscape)/Rehabilitation Standards
Staff Contact: Desiree Aranda, Historic Preservation Officer*

Staff Aranda provided background and introduced the applicant, Tim Smith of Swaim Associates Architects, who presented the project. Commissioners asked questions and discussed the project.

Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner Christopher moved to recommend approval as presented with the following conditions:

1. Provide a mockup of the proposed glazing for comparison to existing glazing to ensure compatibility.
2. Consider replacing a portion of the existing east side security fence with new cable railing at the new connection.

Commissioner Houghton seconded the motion.

No discussion was held.

The motion passed unanimously 4-0. (McDonald absent, left at 3:03 p.m.)

**c. SD-1125-00168/TC-RES-1125-05399 Action
212 E 17th St (Parcel #117072900)**

The proposed project is construction of an attached single-story garage at the west side of the existing single-family residence. The non-contributing carport at the rear property line is proposed for demolition. Also proposed is replacement of existing wood and metal fencing on the south and east sides with a vertically oriented rusted corrugated metal panel fence, and a new metal gate at the alley. The applicant is also seeking approval for an as-built wood picket fence on the north side of the property. PRS may recommend approval, approval with conditions, or denial of the project, or may continue the item to the next meeting.

Full Review/Armory Park HPZ

Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards
Staff Contact: Jason Lilienthal, Historic Preservation Lead Planner

Staff Lilienthal provided background and introduced the applicant Gabriel Vargas who presented the project. Commissioners asked questions and discussed the project. Chair Majewski asked whether this was a code violation. Vargas answered no. Chair Majewski asked if the plans presented today are revised plans according to the conditions made by Armory Park. Gabriel Vargas confirmed that these are revised plans presented today.

Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner Christopher moved to recommend approval of the revised plans as presented with the following conditions:

1. Garage stucco finish to be differentiated from the original house stucco finish.
2. The front fence may remain, although it is not historically appropriate in style.
3. The west setback reduction from 8'-0" to 6'-2" is acceptable.
4. The newer vinyl windows on the rear of the house are not compatible, and a replacement plan should be submitted in the future.

Commissioner Houghton seconded the motion.

No discussion was held.

The motion passed unanimously 4-0. (Commissioner McDonald absent)

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on recent minor reviews.

b. Appeals

No appeals to report.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff reported on recent zoning violations and noted that cases will be brought to PRS when ready.

d. Review Process Issues

Chair Majewski noted that item 5c had revised the drawings according to Armory Park HPZ's conditions and the Plans Review Subcommittee was unable to hear and consider the original drawings. This added confusion to what the commissioners were looking at, whether original or revised. Chair Majewski noted that plans should remain unchanged after an HPZ reviews the item so that PRS considers the same set of plans.

7. Future Agenda Items for Upcoming Meetings

Staff Lilienthal shared upcoming agenda items and reported that the next regular meeting is scheduled for April 9, 2026.

8. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 3:48 p.m.