



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING

March 8, 2024

A quorum of the Civil Service Commission of the City of Tucson met on Friday, March 8, 2024, at 9:27 AM for a Special Meeting regarding proposed changes to the Civil Service Rules. The meeting was held at the Fire Administration Building, 300 S. Fire Central Place, 1st Floor Conference Room in Tucson, AZ. The hearing was made accessible remotely through technological means as permitted under Arizona law as well as in person.

Present were Chairperson Paul Fimbres and Commission Members Rebecca (Becky) Montaña, Eduardo (Eddie) Rios (who appeared remotely), Carol West and Michael (Mick) Mathieu. Staff present were Suzette Yaezenko, HR Director, Elsa Quijada, HR Deputy Director and Designated Commission Secretary, Ryan Saxby, HR Administrator, and Reina Gallego, HR Administrative Assistant and Recording Secretary. Also present were Donna Aversa, Legal Counsel for the Commission, Julianne Hughes and Jennifer Stash, Assistant City Attorneys.

- 9:27 – 9:28 Meeting called to order and roll call. Elsa Quijada advised the Commission that the Commissioners have been provided a copy of the current Civil Service rules to use as reference as proposed changes are discussed. She also asked that after each change is discussed the Commission vote to accept or reject the proposed change.
- 9:28 – 9:43 Suzette Yaezenko made a presentation of the overview of Rule I and the proposed changes. Ryan Saxby provided historical information regarding practices and applications of Rule I. Discussion followed.
- 9:43 Commissioner Mathieu made the motion to accept the proposed changes. Commissioner West seconded the motion but asked Mr. Saxby to summarize the changes for clarification. Motion passed with an oral vote of 5-0.
- 9:45 Suzette Yaezenko made a presentation of the overview of Rule III and the proposed changes. Discussion followed.
- 10:05 Commissioner Mathieu made a motion to accept proposed changes in sections 9 B and 10 B.3. Duly seconded by Commissioner West.
- Julie Hughes recommended the Commission set a time limit to get a report that details the nature of the bias training and to monitor the effectiveness of this training along with the application process to ensure they are working to get the best qualified candidates. Discussion followed.

- 10:09 Chairman Fimbres requested that the Bias training be presented to the Commission at an upcoming meeting, along with a report of what is working and what has not worked. After discussion, the training is tentatively set for the October quarterly meeting. The report of what is working or what has not worked will be set at a later quarterly meeting.
- 10:16 The motion to accept the proposed changes in Rule III, section 9 B and section 10 B.3 was passed with a verbal vote of 5-0.
- 10:17 Suzette Yaezenko continued with the presentation on the changes to the recruitment and application processes. Discussion followed.
- 10:40 Ryan Saxby gave a summary of the remaining proposed changes to Rule III. Discussion followed.
- 11:15 – 11:30 Break
- 11:30 Meeting resumed with a continuation of Ryan Saxby’s summarization of the Rule III proposed changes. Discussion followed.
- 11:36 Commissioner Mathieu made a motion to reject the proposed change from “may” to “will” in Rule III Section 8 A. Discussion followed and it was determined that the motion needed to be amended.
- 11:40 Commissioner Mathieu made an amended motion to accept the proposed changes to Rule III Section 8 A, except for the strikeout of the work “may” in sentence regarding “Subject Matter Experts”. Motion was duly seconded by Commissioner West and passed with an oral vote of 4-0. *(Note: Commissioner Rios had left the meeting prior to the vote).*
- 11:40 Ryan Saxby continued with summarization of proposed changes in Rule III. Discussion followed.
- 11:59 Commissioner Mathieu made a motion to accept the proposed changes to Rule III. Motion was duly seconded and passed with an oral vote of 4-0.
- 12:00 Due to a scheduling conflict Commissioner Mathieu left the meeting.
- 12:00 Ryan Saxby gave a summary of the proposed changes to Rule IV – Establishment of Eligibility List and their use. Commissioner West clarified that paragraph C becomes paragraph B in Section 1. Discussion followed.

- 12:26 Commissioner West made a motion to accept the proposed changes to Rule IV, duly seconded by Commissioner Montaño. The motion passed with an oral vote of 3-0.
- 12:28 The Commission asked questions regarding the process after the rule changes are approved. Discussion followed.
- Chairman Fimbres asked when the rules would be updated and provided to the Commission. It was determined that it could happen as soon as the updated rules are printed out and then provided to the Commissioners.
- 12:36 Julianne Hughes inquired about a previous meeting’s discussion on changing the pronouns in these rules and whether that was done, and if a motion was made to change them on all the rules. Elsa Quijada advised that the issue would need to be added to the next quarterly meeting’s agenda. Discussion followed.
- 12:37 LUNCH Break. To return at 1:30pm
- 1:40 Return from lunch. Ryan Saxby summarized the proposed changes to Rule V – Certification of Applicants. Discussion followed.
- 1:50 Commissioner West made a motion to reject the proposed change in Rule V, section 2 I. Duly seconded by Commissioner Montaño, the motion passed by an oral vote of 3-0.
- 1:50 Ryan Saxby continued with summary of the proposed changes to Rule V, section 2 A & B – Method of Certification. Discussion followed.
- 1:57 Julianne Hughes provided the Commission with an explanation on whole list certification, including reading a 2005 legal opinion from City Attorney Mike Rankin on whole list certifications. Suzette Yaezenko provided an explanation of how the whole list is being used successfully in 911, in addition to Tucson Police and Tucson Fire. Discussion followed.
- 2:36 Chairman Fimbres recommended tabling the discussion on whole list certification at this time and push it out to a later date with HR and the City Attorney’s Office bringing forth arguments on their position before the Commission.
- 2:39 Commissioner West made a motion to accept proposed changes to Rule V, with the exception of Section 2 A. Duly seconded by Commissioner Montaño, the motion passed with an oral vote of 3-0.

2:41 Discussion followed on when to make the presentations and it was tentatively set for the October 2024 quarterly meeting. Commissioner West asked, if possible, for HR to provide a progress report on what is working and what is not working at the April quarterly meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 2:45 PM

Paul Fimbres, Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Date