



## Commission on Climate, Energy, and Sustainability Friday, October 25, 2024, 2:00 PM - 4:00 PM

Conference Room  
City Council Ward 6  
3202 E. 1st Street  
Tucson, Arizona, 85716

### Legal Action Report

#### 1) Call to Order

Meeting called to order at 2:05 PM by Chair Jim Sell

#### Present:

Michael Catanzaro	Energy Manager, Environmental & General Services Department (EGSD)
Jim Sell	Representative, Ward 6
Adriana Bachmann	Representative, Ward 2
Ojas Sanghi	Representative, Ward 3
Garrett Weaver	Representative, City Manager
Camila Martins-Bekat	Representative, City Manager, Tucson Electric Power
Dan Stormont	Representative, City Manager
Vanessa Gallego	Representative, Ward 1 (joined at 2:19, attended for duration)

#### Staff Members & Guests:

Michael Catanzaro	Energy Manager, Environmental & General Services Department (EGSD)
Fatima Luna	Chief Resilience Officer
Amber Gschwend	GDS Consultants
Howard Choy	GDS Consultants
Eryck Garcia	Mayor's Office - City of Tucson
Clifton Mays	
Bob Freitas	
Ryan Baron	
Joe Salkowski	
Russell Lowes	
Natalie Shepp	
Ryan Baron	
Shelly Gordon	
Bill	
Bob Cook	
Lee Ziesche	
Jane Conlin	
Karina Martine Molina	
Christine McLeod	

Cody Hooven

**Absent:**

John Eisele

Representative, City Manager, Environmental  
Organization Combating & Adapting to Climate Change

**2) Approval of Minutes (September 27)**

Comm. Martins-Bekat moved to approve, Comm. Sanghi seconded.

**3) Report from the Chair - None**

**4) Energy Municipalization Study: GDS Consultants**

Chair Sell moved call to the audience portion up immediately after agenda item 4.

**8) Call to Audience**

Eve Shapiro - Physician, hopes they study includes the health care costs. 23% of coal. TEP burning coal every year is impacting the health of Tucson. 1000 people per million are impacted by health care costs. We will never hit our climate goals with a for profit utility.

Clifton Mays - Full support of municipal utility. Important to him because of rate hikes.

Bob Cook - Thanked GDS for their presentation. Was a professional urban planner. The TEP IRP is misrepresenting projects. Asked GDS to consider that past data may be underestimating what we're seeing. Hopes that sensitivity analysis may be outside of data trends. This is about fossil fuels vs. renewables. Very happy CoT is doing the study. Looking forward to a robust analysis.

Lee Ziesche - Organizes with DSA, past year has been talking to Tucson residents and public utility. Looking forward to engaging.

In a petition to Mayor and City Council, feels city is getting a good deal. Wants to see look at rates.

Wants to see what utilities' roles are in major disasters.

Wants to see breakdown of assets that we've already paid for with rate recovery.

Encouraged community engagement through the process. Benefits to hosting the public in community spaces.

Shelly - Great to see the report. We've been talking to cities across the state. All eyes are on the study. Urged city to not put study in the drawer.

CCE is used in New York, Ohio, Maryland, there are 11 states. CCE is a proven model for lowering rates, and increasing renewable energy. CCAs consistently exceed states renewable energy than state mandates. Although CCA is not authorized, she is working on engaging the legislature.

Hope study addresses reliability of service and cost study.

Rick Rappaport - Volunteer with Arizonans' for Community Choice. We have come a long way here. The CAAP was two years in the making. The resources Tucson has are missing. We cannot negotiate with TEP. CEO got 2.4 Million last year. This is a big boy company, they have clout, they have power. We need a warrior. We have to push the city to put us on equal footing.

Russell Lowes - CCE will lead to a total reduction of CO2 emissions. Has been doing economic modeling for az4cc. Said web address is [www.az4cc.org](http://www.az4cc.org). If City of Tucson pushes for authorization and gets it. It could start a CCE in a few years. Shortly after it starts up, 100% in nine years. It could do so much faster than TEPs plans. CO2 reduction would be 98%, and reduction of water use would be 94%. Rates would be lower by about 16%.

Bruce Plenk - Asked Amber about incumbent utilities being unwilling to sell assets. Wanted to know about other solutions in other places around that. Consider proposing helpful tips for organizing state legislation for CCE. Suggest things that should be in authorizing legislation for CCE. There are existing municipal utilities in AZ to see what can be learning from them, but they are small. Looking forward to seeing what they produce.

Jane Conlin - Thanked for the opportunity to speak. Thanked City of Tucson for bringing study. Not predisposed to one particular method to reaching decarbonization. With Citizens' Climate Lobby, looking at ways to decarbonize. Hoping that GDS would include in their study comparison the time element. In 2023, \$38 Billion worth of weather crisis. This year costs were \$50 Billion. No stable nation can sustain that amount of economic hardship. Said Dr. Shapiro asked for health impact be in risks. Look at time in study. Asked for urgency.

Comm. Sanghi - Observed that CCES never had so many people at a meeting beforehand. Shows the community interest in this proposal.

##### **5) Letter to Council about Resilience and Energy Offices**

Commission decided to proceed with writing letters in support of getting more staff on the climate action team.

**6) Energy Manager Report - None**

**7) Climate Resilience Report - None**

**9) Future Agenda items. November/December Meetings**

Comm. Martins-Bekat will be absent on the 22nd.

Comm. Stormont mentioned Bob Bortner with Ward 3 has been having trouble getting a traffic circle in his neighborhood. There may be a misunderstanding of traffic circles in blighting in the area.

Chair Sell said we can look at that in November.

**10) Adjournment** - Chair Sell Adjourned the meeting at 3:34