

## Commission on Equitable Housing and Development Retreat

Friday, February 2, 2024 | 12:00 - 5:30pm

Sentinel Building (310 Commerce Loop)

### Meeting Summary



#### Members in attendance

Maggie Amado-Tellez  
Maryann Beerling  
W. Mark Clark  
Mindy Bernstein  
Laurie Mazerbo  
Tisha Tallman  
Jim Tofel  
Raye Winch  
Kenny H. Wong  
Jay Young  
Koren Manning  
Ann Chanecka  
Mike Edmonds

#### Members absent

Wendy Ascher  
Vicki Cuscino  
Marcos Ysmael

#### Guests

Mayor Romero  
Genesis Cubillas, Mayor's Personal Staff Member

#### City staff

Neto Portillo, HCD (CEHD Staff Liaison)  
Liz Morales, City Manager's Office  
Jason Thorpe, HCD  
Vanessa Gonzalez, HCD  
Stacie Bernades, HCD  
Rachel Hutchinson, HCD  
Alison Miller, HCD  
Sarah Meggison  
Kerry - Dept Dir HCD  
Meghan Heddings, Family Housing Resources

#### Facilitation/documentation

Tahnee Robertson & Colleen Whitaker, Southwest  
Decision Resources

Quorum was established and the meeting was called to order at 12:30pm

## Summary of Actions and decisions:

- Motion to acquire permanent facilitation for CEHD funded by City - Mark; Second - Jay. All in favor, none opposed.
- SDR will create a survey of in-person meeting day/time preferences. Neto will circulate.
- Mission - full Commission review and finalize desired edits and send to Mayor and Council for approval (see table page 6)
- Goals and next steps - each subcommittee meet to review suggested edits to goals and next steps (see table page 6)

## ~Notes~

### 1. Remarks from Mayor Romero

*The Mayor shared reflections on the creation of the CEHD, successes to date, the importance of the work and her priorities ahead with relevance to the CEHD. A summary of comments is presented here.*



- By the time she was elected as Mayor she had 12 years of experience in office as a council member. Her "working families" agenda built on this experience and desire to correct historic wrongs, including historic disinvestment in areas of our community that have been long ignored.
- The creation of the CEHD was part of this agenda, and was done so with the help of Councilmembers Santa Cruz and Durham in particular. The mission statement for CEHD was written at a retreat in 2020.
- It was important to them to include ex-official staff members as well as community members with real life experience of the issues they wanted to address.
- When she was elected, Tucson did not have an Affordable Housing Strategy. Once initiated the process moved quickly and the strategy was developed within about three months. The CEHD played an important role in developing the plan.
- She encouraged members not to give up when things move slowly through government; it will take time to see tangible benefits from the work of the CEHD. We need a steady hand and move the best policies forward.
- There have been many affordable housing successes. For example there is now over \$100M in state and federal coming to Tucson that many on the CEHD helped to achieve.
- The first three years of the CEHD have been incredibly successful, and she believes the commission will continue to mature and innovate.
- Tucson has the highest poverty rate in the state. 25% of families live in poverty.

### Mayoral priorities and suggestions for CEHD:

- Prosperity Initiative
  - This includes 13 policy priorities approved by Pima County and Tucson, and one is about affordable housing.
  - CEHD should become familiar with this initiative.
- Look outside of housing policy
  - This includes the upcoming land use code changes
  - Research other cities for innovative work on their housing plans
- Be curious and ask questions
  - If CEHD wants to learn about things going on in Pima County, the City or Mayor and council, invite them to a meeting to come and talk about what is happening and think about ways to work together - coordinate with Dan Sullivan for a meeting.
- Collaborative with Pima County - learn what they are doing on affordable housing. How can they be a good partner to CEHD?
- Tour different neighborhoods (especially to see the needs in newer areas)
- Role of the CEHD:
  - Ambassadors of affordability
  - M&C asks for one annual presentation a year from all commissions
  - Advocate with councilmembers to work on certain issues within City of Tucson

### Questions and discussion:

- Jim - have been talking together with Mark and Marcos about having a joint commission meeting with Pima County Housing and CEHD. Mark will follow-up.
- Maryann - is there any possibility of Pima County and City of Tucson working together on one bond? It would be good for CEHD to learn about the possibilities and barriers.
- Jay - what role do other municipalities have in terms of housing and land use?
  - Mayor - during my time at Pima County they passed a bond for affordable housing and neighborhood reinvestment. This was the only time Pima County has put money into affordable housing and urban neighborhood reinvestment. Since then affordable housing has dropped off Pima County radar. Their last bond election failed and they have been very careful about floating the idea of a bond again. It will take City, County and other jurisdictions working together to put together a thoughtful package to improve quality of life for Pima County and City of Tucson. This conversation can start. More people are talking again.
  - The stigma attached to affordable housing is very strong. There is an important element of community education to this. affordable housing design must be good and dignified.
- Jay - How does M&C envision operationalizing the Prosperity Initiative and how can the CEHD support that?
  - Mayor - City is already working on these policy priorities, many have already been put into action. Some of these will need to be the City of Tucson, Pima County and nonprofits working together. There is also a lot of overlap with Plan Tucson; we need to follow a strategy as a community.
- Jim - very valuable for CEHD to hear from the Mayor. We would like to invite a council member to attend on a quarterly or semi-regular basis.

- Ann can make the invites and help get it on councilmembers calendars.

## 2. Member introductions

*Members took time to introduce themselves including a brief personal background, why they are interested in the work of the commission, and hobbies.*

## 3. HCD priorities and considerations for CEHD - Ann Chanecka

*Ann provided an overview of the HCD Impact Areas with a view to identifying items the CEHD may want more input on. A summary of information shared is presented here.*

- HCD is the department that supports CEHD. They want to best engage CEHD and get input in an efficient way as well as support goals identified by CEHD.
- HCD Impact Areas:
  - Addressing homelessness - Housing First, Tucson Pima Collaboration to End Homelessness (City of Tucson is lead of this regional coalition), Non-profit grant making
  - Affordable Housing - El Pueblo Housing Development Corporation, Affordable Housing Financing, El Portal Affordable Housing Units
  - Public Housing
  - Housing Choice Voucher Program
  - Homebuyer and Homeowner Assistance Programs
  - Community Revitalization
- Key projects to pay attention to in the next year, and those that HCD would like input on:
  - Consolidated Plan (which must be done every 5 years).
  - Public Housing - next month will review proposed updates to the plans to share with CEHD
  - The above are HUD requirements, and the documents are hard to slog through. In 2020 they tried to create a more community-focused plan [PCHIP]. This is also coming up on 5th year and need to update.
  - Community education - how can we help people understand the trade offs and value/need for affordable housing?
  - Homeowner Repair Program - have a long wait list (to address emergency needs).
  - Down Payment Assistance Program
- CEHD Decision-making:
  - CEHD was created to be an advisory committee.
  - She recommends focusing on this - advise M&C on any areas related to affordable housing and equitable development.
  - Help hold City accountable
- Re: Prosperity Initiative - Allison is one of the main people working on this. They are working to build out actions to the framework the Mayor shared. There are opportunities for CEHD input here.

### Questions/comments:

- Raye - on the Homeowner Repair Program, would love for CEHD to advocate that this program be funded at the level needed. Wait times for these essential home repairs are currently so long

that there is proposal for a new prioritization tool to decide on who needs services the most. Would like to understand what funding levels are needed so this can be part of our recommendations.

- Ann - there is concern about a lack of organizations and contractors to do the work. Need more people trained to do this work.
- Mark - Tucson Pima Council on Aging is also working on this and has the same problem with finding trained people. Could we work together?
- Maryann - Mayor has tasked HCD with a lot. HCD is the least funded in City, and has the bulk of working with vulnerable populations. Can we advise the City Council to take a look at this? (several members agreed)
  - Tisha - there are never enough resources. We can provide information on how to leverage opportunities with different players (e.g. Mark's suggestion to work together on home repair trained staff). Collaboration is key.
- Jay - process is important. How can we be efficient with the asks from HCD? How do we turn this into action?
  - Ann - the Complete Streets Coordinating Council (CSCC) agendas are useful in terms of including the purpose of each agenda item.
  - Jay - CSCC also has permanent facilitation, which could be useful for us.

#### 4. Mission and goals

*The group reviewed the current mission and goals and discussed desired revisions. Suggested changes are presented below as redlines, and a summary of discussion points follows each goal. Each subcommittee reviewed, made additional edits, and finalized in subsequent meetings. See [Appendix A](#) for final versions.*

##### Mission

The Commission will review, investigate, and recommend actions to the Mayor and City Council, based on research, data, and inclusive public input, ~~to increase the number of housing units that will:~~ **to ensure that all Tucsonans have an affordable place to live. [Focus areas of the Commission]:**

1. Develop and preserve affordability for all Tucsonans, including renters, homeowners, and those without housing.
2. Protect barrios and communities from rapid change and displacement as well as structural disinvestment. *(consider adding something about making recommendations for repairing harm)*
3. ~~Cultivate~~ **Collaborate with** landlords and developers ~~as partners~~ in providing equitable, accessible, and quality **affordable** housing.
4. **Serve as a forum for community collaboration and education around issues of equitable, accessible and quality housing.**

~Discussion and next steps~

- Ann noted that in order to edit the Mission, the CEHD would need to vote on an edited version and send it to M&C to be adopted.
- "Preserving units" has not been a focus so far; could work more on this.
- #2 has not been something that has been a focus yet, but should be.

- Mayor suggested going to visit these neighborhoods - research this and make recommendation.
- Need input from neighborhoods about what protection means for those at risk of displacement
- Add - "and make recommendations for repairing harm" - want a look at historic harm to be part of this and the lens of work (e.g. special purpose credit programs)
- #3 "collaborating with landlords" should also include educating both landlords and neighbors about the benefits of affordable housing.
- #4 Community Forum
  - The group agreed this is not about being a community convener. This is likely more about inviting people into the commission to have dialogue. This should be revisited.
  - There may be a need for more community education about what is available and how to navigate opportunities (Maryann noted Compass has funding for a website).
  - The aspect of community education and communication is important, and each subcommittee should consider adding an action item related to this.

### **Affordable Housing Goals**

1. Provide a set of recommendations to Mayor and Council on activities/levers/tools the city can leverage to **preserve and** increase momentum around affordable housing (short-term and mid-term goal)
2. Identify **and advocate for** new funding opportunities **sources** for **preserving and creating** affordable housing (both short-term and long-term goals)
3. **Establish and monitor progress toward a goal of x affordable housing units** Deliver a sufficient number (TBD) of new affordable housing units within the City of Tucson (long-term goal)

### **Housing Desegregation Goals** (rename **Equitable Housing Strategies**)

~~1. Address housing segregation by race, ethnicity, disability, and access to opportunities in Tucson (housing patterns show the legacy of racism)(long-term goal)~~

1. Be a clearing house for equitable housing policy and advocacy.
2. Explore and research (or become educated / distill lessons) equitable housing policies around the country, with a focus on how they address housing segregation
3. Work with City of Tucson departments to provide recommendations to Mayor and Council on equitable housing strategies
4. Collaborate with the City of Tucson to develop a set of indicators to measure housing equity in Tucson over time.

### **~Discussion and next steps~**

- There is some concern about the removal of "race, ethnicity, disability." The group agreed to develop a definition of equitable housing that would relay this.
- Look at report from City of Tucson Office of Equity (p16)
- Revisit the new suggested goal statements at the next subcommittee meeting and work on the definition of equitable housing. Try to get down to 3 goals.

## **Housing First Goals**

1. Provide recommendations on policies to increase / accelerate available Permanent Supportive Housing (both short-term and long-term goals) *(no suggested edits)*

~Discussion~

- This subcommittee has struggled with direction; meet with Jason, then discuss.
- The group felt this should go beyond recommendations.
- Should this include a goal about disinvestment?

## **Next steps on mission and goals**

*The group discussed and developed specific next steps associated with each goal area. These are presented in the table below with the updated goal language.*

| <b>Mission/goals</b><br>(note: language here shows all suggestions from above as accepted)                                                                                         | <b>Next steps</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Mission</b>                                                                                                                                                                     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Full Commission finalize desired changes to language; send to Mayor and Council for approval</li><li>• Mayor suggested visiting neighborhoods in most need and making recommendations (related to #2 in mission language)</li></ul>                                                                       |
| <b>Affordable Housing</b><br>1. Provide a set of recommendations to Mayor and Council on activities/levers/tools the city can leverage to preserve and increase affordable housing | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Review and finalize edits to goal language (for all goals)</li><li>• Provide feedback on proposed land use zoning tools</li><li>• Help make the case for the community "why this is important" (community education/communication)</li><li>• Look at tools to promote accessible home ownership</li></ul> |
| 2. Identify and advocate for new funding sources for preserving and creating affordable housing                                                                                    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Coordinate with the County Housing Commission (Jim/Mark/Marcos set up). Discuss Housing Trust Fund and Housing Bond</li></ul>                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 3. Establish and monitor progress toward a goal of x affordable housing units                                                                                                      | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Complete establishing the housing goal and bring to full Commission</li><li>• Get current count of units - work with City on inventory (SALT, Habitat 4 Humanity, HUD 202) and a deeper dive on homeownership</li></ul>                                                                                   |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Equitable Housing Strategies</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Be a clearing house for equitable housing policy and advocacy.</li> <li>2. Explore and research equitable housing policies around the county (with a focus on how they address housing segregation)</li> <li>3. Work with City of Tucson departments to provide recommendations to Mayor and Council on equitable housing strategies</li> <li>4. Collaborate with the City of Tucson to develop a set of indicators to measure housing equity in Tucson over time.</li> </ol> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review and finalize edits to goal language</li> <li>• Organize field trips to neighborhoods to learn more</li> <li>• Research cities from the equity study (maybe interviews/meetings)</li> <li>• Get relevant info from PDSO. Analyze and synthesize what the City is already doing regarding equity policy and compare to what is being done in other places (spreadsheet).</li> <li>• Meet with the Office of Equity. Formalize their participation in the subcommittee.</li> <li>• Develop definition of equitable housing (see report for City of Tucson Office of Equity pg. 16)</li> </ul> |
| <b>Housing First</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Provide recommendations on policies to increase / accelerate available Permanent Supportive Housing (no suggested edits yet to this goal)</li> </ol>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Meet with City (Jason, Mari, Brandy). - completed</li> <li>• Arrange meeting with TPCH leadership to help identify how the subcommittee can support and advance the work to end homelessness in Tucson.</li> <li>• Revise goals after meeting with more direction</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>Overall</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Add an action for each subcommittee that is focused on community education and communication                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

## 5. Subcommittee structure

- Proposed combination of Housing First and Affordable Housing Subcommittees.
  - There was brief discussion on this, but the group felt that Housing First is a separate and important topic and these should not be combined.
- Proposed creation of a new subcommittee focused on communication, education
  - There was not interest in creating this subcommittee at this time. This can be revisited as progress is made on current subcommittee goals.

## 6. Roles, responsibilities, process

### Examples from the Complete Streets Coordinating Council (CSCC)

- Tahnee and Colleen shared some examples from facilitating the CSCC. Practices that been successful there:
  - Rolling co-chairs for 6 months at a time
  - Pre-Commission meeting to develop agenda - facilitators, co-chairs, staff liaison (who is also the Complete Streets Program Coordinator)
  - Agenda includes specific purpose statements for each item (e.g. information-sharing, decision item, etc.)
  - Decision-making is consensus based
  - The group meets twice a year in person, and also has an annual in-person retreat

### Improvements to CEHD process

*The group discussed and decided on the following changes moving forward*

- Pre-Commission agenda development meetings (Ann or someone on her team agreed to be part of this)
- Permanent facilitation - Ann indicated this was possible if the Commission agreed.
  - **Motion to acquire permanent facilitation funded by the City for CEHD** - Mark; Second - Jay. Roll call vote - all in attendance voted yes.
- Change to in-person meetings for full commission meetings, with subcommittees still virtual.
  - SDR will develop a survey on day/time preferences, and desire for hybrid
  - Location: HCD was agreed to be a convenient location (same space as today).
  - Consider accessibility for audio
- Liaison support for CEHD and Subcommittees:
  - Need one relevant person for each subcommittee
  - Commission as a whole - Neto is liaison, Ann is ex-officio member of Commission

## 7. Final thoughts and wrap up

*Members shared their reflections on the day. Almost all noted the importance and benefit of meeting in person and getting to know each other better.*

**The meeting was adjourned at 5:20pm by the Chair.**

## Appendix A: Final Mission and Goals

Following the retreat, each subcommittee met to finish edits and refinements to their updated goals. The final mission and subcommittee goals were approved by the CEHD in May and June of 2024.

### **Mission** - Approved on June 6, 2024 by the Commission

The Commission will review, investigate, and recommend actions to the Mayor and City Council, based on research, data, and inclusive public input, to ensure that all Tucsonans have equitable, accessible, and affordable housing. Focus areas of the Commission:

1. Develop and preserve affordability for all Tucsonans, including renters, homeowners, and those without housing.
2. Protect barrios and communities from rapid change and displacement as well as structural disinvestment, recognizing past harm and advocating for efforts to repair past harm and mitigate future harm.
3. Alternate wording: Identify and reduce barriers to creating and maintaining equitable, accessible, and quality affordable housing.
4. Serve as a forum for community collaboration and education around issues of equitable, accessible and quality housing.

### Previous

*The Commission will review, investigate, and recommend actions to the Mayor and City Council, based on research, data, and inclusive public input, to increase the number of housing units that will:*

1. *Develop and preserve affordability for all Tucsonans, including renters, homeowners, and those without housing.*
2. *Protect barrios and communities from rapid change and displacement as well as structural disinvestment.*
3. *Cultivate landlords and developers as partners in providing equitable, accessible, and quality housing.*

### **Subcommittee Goals** - Approved on May 2, 2024 by the Commission

#### **Affordable Housing Subcommittee Goals**

1. Provide a set of recommendations to CEHD for consideration to Mayor and Council on activities / levers / tools the City can leverage to preserve and increase affordable housing (short-term and long-term goal)
2. Identify and advocate for new funding sources for preserving and creating affordable housing (short-term and long-term goal)
3. Establish and monitor progress towards a goal of 15,000 affordable housing units by 2030 including both rental and home ownership, within the City of Tucson.

4. Make recommendations to CEHD for consideration to Mayor and Council to streamline the housing development processes and identify regulations that are barriers to development.

#### **Equitable Housing Strategies Subcommittee Goals**

1. Gather, share, and maintain research about equitable housing policies and advocacy around the country, with a focus on how they address housing segregation and equity
2. Work with City of Tucson departments to provide recommendations to CEHD for Mayor and Council on equitable housing strategies
3. Collaborate with the City of Tucson to develop a set of indicators to measure housing equity in Tucson over time, including race, ethnicity, disability, income, and access to opportunities in Tucson, recognizing that housing patterns show the legacy of racism.

#### **Housing First Subcommittee Goals**

Make recommendations to CEHD for consideration to Mayor and Council on:

1. Policies from other housing first programs in similar cities, including emergency interim responses be implemented.
2. Program and service models used by other cities' housing first programs.
3. Implementation ideas at the intersection of housing first and the Prosperity Initiative.