2024

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission

Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS)

LEGAL ACTION REPORT/Minutes

Thursday, January 09, 2025

This was a hybrid meeting. The meeting was accessible at the provided link to allow for participating in-person, virtually and/or calling in.

Note: A recording of the entire meeting (audio/video) can be accessed at https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLUfRGd7RxAUv6rMbRNEurig1iY8N4ZALR

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

The meeting was called to order at 1:02 P.M., and per roll call, a quorum was established.

<u>Commissioners Present (all virtual)</u>: Teresita Majewski (Chair), Andrew Christopher, Rikki Riojas Joel Ireland, Jan Mulder, and Savannah McDonald

Commissioners Absent: None

<u>Applicants/Public Present (all virtual)</u>: Axel Golden (architect, Studio Golden LLC), Luis Valadez (property owner, case 3b), Bill Mackey (architect, worker, inc.), Alexandra Zamecnik (Executive Director, Native Seeds / SEARCH, and John Burr (Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board [APHZAB]).

<u>Staff Present (in person)</u>: Michael Taku and Maria Gayosso (City of Tucson, Planning and Development Services Department [PDSD]).

2. Review and approval of the Legal Action Report/Minutes (LAR) for the Meetings of 12/10/2024 and 12/12/2024

The LAR/Minutes for the meetings of 12/10/2024 and 12/12/2024 were not ready and will be approved at the meeting of 01/23/2025.

3. Historic Preservation Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

3a. SD-0824-00080, 720 S 3rd Avenue

Repair back porch enclosure. New stucco. New window and door locations. Repair back porch stem wall foundation. Modify window opening and replace side door with window on the main part of the house. New masonry wall at front of the house with a gate 4' maximum height.

Full Review/Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Taku presented background on the project and noted that this proposal was initially reviewed by APHZAB on September 17, 2024, and continued for needing revisions to the design. APHZAB reviewed again on November 19, 2024, and staff read into the record the action taken by the APHZAB, which voted unanimously 6-0 to recommend approval as presented, subject to the following conditions: 1) the front wall will be reduced to no more than 48"; 2) a minor review will be undertaken to determine (a) a more historically compatible front gate design; (b) assess which original windows can be repaired vs. replaced/replicated (except the two south windows discussed, which are approved for in-kind replicated replacement); and (c) the expanded (combined) kitchen window will retain the original voussoir, repair string courses, allow for an expanded sill, and feature two side-by-side wood double-hung windows with a center post in the now horizontal opening.

Axel Golden, architect, on behalf of the property owner Rower Maria Sofia Robledo, provided an overview of the project, clarified points, and answered questions during the presentation.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner Riojas moved to recommended to approval of the project as presented with the following conditions:

- (1) assess current condition of the windows and repair, otherwise replace in kind;
- (2) that the boarded-up window located on the southeast corner can be replaced in-kind:
- (3) that the kitchen window be mulled together with a center post in the now horizontal opening;
- (4) that the front yard wall be no taller than 4' all the way around; and
- (5) that the front gate be transparent and return for a minor review.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Christopher.

The motion passed unanimously with a roll call vote of 6-0.

3b. SD-0724-00070/TC-RES-1223-10167, 707 E 1st Street (Code Violation)

Replaced drywall, new siding at back end of house, remove/replaced new windows, replaced door, new wrought iron door on the back end of house, back wood stairs, replaced with cement stairs and slab for water heater and proposed enclosure. Review for full code compliance.

Full Review/West University Historic Preservation Zone Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Taku presented background on the project as a zoning violation and read into the record the action taken by the West University Historic Zone Advisory

Board (WUHZAB) at their meeting of November 12, 2024. WUHZAB voted unanimously 6-0 to recommend approval for 3 windows, front and rear security doors, concrete landing and stairs, and new door, all as presented.

Luis Valadez, property owner, provided an overview of the project, clarified points, and answered questions during the presentation.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner Christopher moved to recommend approval of the project as presented.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Mulder.

The motion passed unanimously with a roll call vote of 6-0.

3c. TP-PRE-1124-00263, 3584 E River Road

Construction of a metal barn building with painted metal B-Deck siding (neutral color) or rusted corrugated metal siding. The barn will have a gable roof with 2:12 pitch, 8'-deep recessed porches along the north and east sides of the building, located northwest of the existing office building. Two contributing structures to the district are located on the site.

Courtesy Review/Binghampton Rural Historic District, Pima County Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Taku noted that was a courtesy review from Pima County. Applicants are seeking feedback, and no action will be required.

Architect Bill Mackey (worker, inc.) along with Alexandra Zamecnik, Executive Director, Native Seed / SEARCH, provided an overview of the proposed changes, clarified points, and answered questions during the presentation. Presenter stated the barn building will be used for farm equipment and have areas for seed-curing activities, office space with bathrooms, and a water-harvesting tank on the north side. Presenter showed the contributing structures/buildings on the existing property. The location of the barn has to do with their water-harvesting plan. This property is in the floodplain [with rich soil for agricultural purposes], and the area where the barn is being located is the least favorable agricultural land. Native Seeds / SEARCH has worked on for the past few years as part of a master plan for their site along with a water-harvesting plan. They vetted this project with Pima County Natural Resources with a concurrence of no adverse effect on the property.

Discussion was held. Feedback from the subcommittee included acknowledgment that the design looked good. PRS wished them luck on the project. Chair Majewski noted that there was a lot of farming going on in that area historically, and that the Rural Historic District was either the first or one of the first created in Tucson. There were Chinese gardens in the area in the late 19th century/early 20th century. In addition, the proposed project is sensitive to the historic rural landscape.

No action was taken.

4. Public and Institutional Use in a Development Zone Discussion

4a. Discussion on the Use of Public and Institutional buildings as Comparative Properties in Development Zones

No report presented.

5. Task Force on Inclusivity Report Recommendations

5a. Discussion on Best Practices for Naming of City- and County-Owned Physical Assets

No report presented.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

6a. Minor Reviews

Staff Taku made a request help from all PRS to assist in reviewing the pending over 33 minor review cases. All members agreed to help. Staff will be contacting for availability and scheduling.

6b. Appeals

Staff Taku noted no pending appeal(s).

6c. Zoning Violations

Staff Taku noted that there are ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance and/or in the review process, and that staff are working with their zoning violation code enforcement liaison. Staff noted that there are violation cases being worked on that eventually will be reviewed by PRS.

6d. Review Process Issues

The position of Historic Preservation Officer remains open, and interviews have started for hiring.

7. Summary of Public Comments (Information Only)

No public comment was received by the posted deadline.

8. Future Agenda Items for Upcoming Meetings

The next scheduled meeting is January 23, 2025. Staff Taku indicated that the following cases are scheduled for the agenda: 819 N. Euclid - zoning violation; 3488 E. Via Golondrina (new shop/garage deck), and 1132 N. Stone - former Econolodge/Travelodge to Transitional Youth Housing Project, Courtesy Review.

PRS members to be present: Majewski, Mulder, McDonald, Ireland, and Christopher.

9. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 2:37 P.M.