

2024

**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**  
Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS)

**LEGAL ACTION REPORT/Minutes**

**Thursday, October 24, 2024**

This was a hybrid meeting. The meeting was accessible at the provided link to allow for participating in-person, virtually and/or calling in.

Note: A recording of the entire meeting (audio/video) can be accessed at <https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLUfRGd7RxAUv6rMbrNEurjg1iY8N4ZALR>

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

The meeting was called to order at 1:03 P.M., and per roll call, a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Teresita Majewski (Chair), Andrew Christopher, Joel Ireland, and Jan Mulder [virtual]

Commissioners Absent: Rikki Riojas

Applicants/Public Present: Drew Cook; Charles Pifer; Corky Poster; Margo Sackheim; Elaine Hill; Logan Haven; Gustavo Silva

Staff Present: Michael Taku (in-person) (City of Tucson, Planning and Development Services Department [PDSD]), Jasmine Chan (virtual) (Parks and Recreation Department [P&R]), Martyn Klell, Scott O'Mack, Kenny Moore, and Manuel Roseau (virtual) (Pima County).

**2. Review and approval of the Legal Action Report/Minutes (LAR) for the Meeting of October 10, 2024**

**Motion:** Commissioner Christopher to approve the Legal Action Report/Minutes for the meeting of October 10, 2024, as submitted.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Mulder.

The motion passed unanimously by a roll call vote of 4-0. (Commissioner Riojas absent)

**3. Historic Preservation Review Cases**  
*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines*  
*Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines*

**3a. SD-0924-00084, 538 W 17<sup>th</sup> Street, Unit #2**

Construction of an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) in the rear yard.  
Full Review/ Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone  
Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Taku presented background on the project and noted that the proposed model design was the winner of the City of Tucson ADU model design contest. Staff read into the record the action taken by the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) from the meeting of September 09, 2024. BHHZAB voted unanimously 6-0 to recommend approval, subject to the following conditions: that the 2' setback to the east lot line and 0' setback to the north lot lines respectively be waived as being prevalent within the development zone and consistent with the design guidelines.

Logan Havens (Designer) and Silva Gustavo (architect), on behalf of the property owners Charles Flanders and Brenna Patania, provided an overview of the project, clarified points, and answered questions during the presentation.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner Mulder moved to recommend approval of the project as presented with the following conditions: that the 2' setback to the east lot line and 0' setback to the north lot lines respectively be waived as being prevalent within the development zone and consistent with the design guidelines.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Christopher.

The motion passed unanimously with a roll call vote of 4-0. (Commissioner Riojas absent)

- 3b. 819 N Euclid Avenue, SD-0824-00073/ CE-VI00223-01669 [Code Violation]**  
Repair and replace existing roof system. Replacing existing eaves and fascia.  
Repair and replace windows and door casements and T1-11 sidings.  
Full Review/ West University Historic Preservation Zone  
Contributing Resource/Estimated time: 30 minutes

Applicant not present. Review will be scheduled for a future date.

- 3c. SD-0824-00072/CIP-0324-00003, 5531 E Fort Lowell Road**  
Rehabilitation of the Donaldson House.  
Full Review/Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone  
Non-Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

As a prelude to the Fort Lowell Commissary/El Cuartel Viejo and the Donaldson House reviews, Chair Majewski read into the record a public comment provided by Demion Clinco on behalf of the Tucson Historic Preservation Foundation on

September 23, 2024. The comment was provided by staff to the subcommittee as part of the review documents. It is a city-owned property and managed in partnership with Pima County. Additionally, the rehabilitation work is part of a bond project. Finally, the need for site-specific architectural documentation was emphasized.

Staff Taku presented background on the project, noting that this was presented to the Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board (FLHZAB) on March 25, 2024, to the TPCHC Historic Landscapes Subcommittee on March 28, 2024, and to PRS as a courtesy review on April 25, 2024. Additionally, a minor historic review had been conducted for the emergency roof repairs and stabilization. Staff read into the record the action taken by FLHZAB from the meeting of August 26, 2024. FLHZAB voted unanimously 4-0 to recommend approval of the project as presented with the following conditions: (1) that the terracotta roof tiles be removed in favor of a more historically appropriate material seen within the Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone; (2) that any changes to the front arched entryway doors be brought back to the FLHZAB for another review; (3) and that any design changes to the existing flooring be brought back to the FLHZAB for another review.

**Review note:** According to City Property Research Online (PRO), The Donaldson House is not individually listed, and not a contributor to the Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone (HPZ) or Fort Lowell Multiple Resource Area (MRA). In response, Elaine Hill and Corky Poster argued that the house is a contributor as evidenced by the Property Inventory Form and other Fort Lowell Historic documentation. PRS approach is to consider the Donaldson House review as a contributing resource to the Fort Lowell HPZ.

Architect Drew Cook and Corky Poster (Poster, Mirto, McDonald Architects [PMM]) provided an overview of the site, scope of work, and clarified and answered questions during the presentation.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner Mulder moved to recommend approval as presented, subject to the following conditions: (1) the City of Tucson resolve/determine whether or not the Donaldson House is a contributing resource to the Fort Lowell HPZ [and correct City records as needed]; (2) the front door as presented to PRS be returned to FLHZAB for review and that subsequent front door changes, if any, be returned to PRS for minor review; (3) an interpretive exhibit be installed; (4) the development of a comprehensive historic architectural report for each site within the district be commissioned by the City in consultation with the County on the scope of work; (5) the scoping and completion of the report should not hold up the permitting for the current project for the Donaldson House; and (6) the reports must be completed before the certificate of occupancy is issued. Noted that these reports are essential for guiding future management, development, and preservation efforts, ensuring the long-term protection and sustainability of these historically significant properties.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Christopher.

The motion passed unanimously with a roll call vote of 4-0. (Commissioner Riojas absent)

**3d. CIP-0824-00029, 325 W 2<sup>nd</sup> Street**

Dunbar Coalition Phase II: Exterior abatement work-  
Stucco options for resolving lead paint contamination.  
Courtesy Review/John Spring National Historic District  
Individually Listed/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Taku presented background on the project, noting that a courtesy review for an emergency roof repair to preserve the historic building was presented to PRS on September 24, 2024. Given that this is a multiphase project, this review is limited to determining options for mitigating lead paint contamination.

Architect Charles Pifer (PMM) along with Freda Marshall, Executive Director, Dunbar Pavilion, provided an overview of the proposed changes, clarified points, and answered questions during the presentation. Presenter described the scope of work to be stucco options to abate lead paint asbestos. The options included: (1) encapsulate stucco with additional layer of stucco; (2) remove and replace stucco with in-kind; and (3) encapsulate stucco with spray or roll-applied encapsulant.

Discussion was held. Feedback from the subcommittee included but was not limited to consensus to support option #2. Option #1 may be okay but will need repeat treatment. Option #3 is a "No Go." A suggestion was made to look for the original color for the building, which would be more historically appropriate.

No action was taken.

**4. Public and Institutional Use in a Development Zone Discussion**

**4a. Discussion on the Use of Public and Institutional buildings as Comparative Properties in Development Zones**

No report presented.

**5. Task Force on Inclusivity Report Recommendations**

**5a. Discussion on Best Practices for Naming of City- and County-Owned Physical Assets**

No report presented.

**6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion**

**6a. Minor Reviews**

Staff Taku summarized the projects reviewed: 502 E. 4<sup>th</sup> Street for roof replacement (West University); 748 S. 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue for roof replacement, and 138 E. 14<sup>th</sup> Street for roof replacement, all in the Armory Park HPZ; and 460 S. Otero for solar in the Barrio Historico HPZ. The applicant did not show. Commissioner Christopher assisted with these virtual reviews.

Staff will request availability for new reviews: 717 N. 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue for stucco (West University HPZ); 846 S. 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue for solar (Armory Park HPZ); and 72 E. Congress - Indian Trading Post (RNA). Commissioners Ireland and Mulder volunteered to help with these reviews.

**6b. Appeals**

Staff Taku noted no pending appeal(s).

**6c. Zoning Violations**

Staff Taku noted that there are ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance and/or in the review process, and that staff are working with their zoning violation code enforcement liaison. Staff noted that there are violation cases being worked on that eventually will be reviewed by PRS.

**6d. Review Process Issues**

The position of Historic Preservation Officer has been posted for hiring.

**7. Summary of Public Comments (Information Only)**

A Public Comment was submitted by Demion Clinco and read into the record by Chair Majewski during Item 3c.

**8. Future Agenda Items for Upcoming Meetings**

The next scheduled meeting is November 11, 2024. Staff Taku indicated as follows: CAPSTONE Mixed Used at 812 E. Speedway Blvd [West University HPZ]; Johnny Gibson Restaurant, 222 E. Congress [RNA]; Remodel at 911 N. 6<sup>th</sup> Ave [West University HPZ]; Rehabilitation at 582 S. Main [Barrio Historico HPZ]; West University HPZ Design Guidelines revision; and Barrio Historico HPZ Design Guidelines revisions, and Milagro HAWK lights, 1130 W. Miracle Mile [Miracle Mile Historic District].

PRS is considering a Special Meeting on either 11/5, 11/19, or 11/21, 2024. Staff will send out a Doodle pool for these dates to all members.

**9. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 3:16 P.M.