

2024

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission

Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS)

LEGAL ACTION REPORT/Minutes

Thursday, September 12, 2024

This was a hybrid meeting. The meeting was accessible at the provided link to allow for participating in-person, virtually, and/or calling in.

Note: A recording of the entire meeting (audio/video) can be accessed at <https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLUfRGd7RxAUv6rMbRNEurjg1iY8N4ZALR>

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

The meeting was called to order at 1:03 P.M., and per roll call, a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Teresita Majewski (Chair), Andrew Christopher, Jan Mulder, and Rikki Riojas [virtual].

Commissioners Absent: Joel Ireland

Applicants/Public Present: Zoe Sadorf, Karena Makomaski, Brandon Willman, Drew Cook, Martyn Klell, Charles Pifer, John Wallace, and Elaine Hill [virtual].

Staff Present: Michael Taku, Christina Anaya (in-person) and Dan Bursuck (virtual) (City of Tucson, Planning and Development Services Department [PDSD]), Sarah Meggison and Johanna Hernandez (virtual) (Housing and Community Development Department[HCD]).

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report/Minutes for the Meeting of August 22, 2024

Motion: Commissioner Riojas moved to approve the Legal Action Report/Minutes for the meeting of August 22, 2024, as submitted.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Christopher.

The motion passed unanimously by a roll call vote of 4-0. (Commissioner Ireland absent)

3. Historic Preservation Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines
Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

3a. TD-DEV-1023-00435, 1135 W Miracle Mile

Rehabilitation of existing motel for a multi-family development.
Full Review/Miracle Mile National Register Historic District
Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Taku provided background on the proposed project, indicating that on April 25, 2024, the project came before PRS for a full review for a 31-unit multi-family development, and the subcommittee requested that the Amazon Motel sign be returned to PRS for review.

Staff Hernandez noted that SHPO has provided concurrence for the Treatment Plan for the Amazon Motel sign

Architect Zoe Sadorf from Poster Mirto McDonald (PMM), on behalf of City of Tucson Housing & Community Development, provided an overview of the treatment plan for the sign and proposed changes, clarified points, and answered questions during the presentation. Presenter described the sign and proposed changes as follows: replace copy on main sign channel letters from "Amazon MOTEL" to the name of the future multi-family apartment building on the site – "Amazon FLATS"; remove added blade marquee sign and last remaining backlit cabinet sign reading "TRUCK PARKING"; remove neon and painted text reading "POOL" from secondary rhombus sign as pool is being infilled; restore lighting function to Amazon FLATS neon and three globe fixtures at the top of the support posts; and restore colors of sign components and globe lights to match historic condition

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

Motion: Commissioner Mulder moved to recommend approval of the Treatment Plan as presented with the following conditions:

- A forensic review of the historic colors be undertaken.
- The smaller sign includes either a neon address number or a neon border on the face of the smaller sign.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Christopher.

The motion passed unanimously with a roll call vote of 4-0. (Commissioner Ireland absent)

3b. TP-PRE-0724-00168, 180 N Main Avenue Action

Rehabilitation of the J.K. Corbett House into an event center for the Tucson Museum of Art (TMA), Renovate patio, construct new walls and entry.
Fire damage restoration.
Courtesy Review/El Presidio Historic Preservation Zone
Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Taku provided background on the proposed project, noting that it had been reviewed by the El Presidio Historic Zone Advisory Board (EPHZAB) on August 7,

2024, and indicated that the board had expressed some concerns but that the board generally supported the project.

The project was presented by Karena Makomaski and Brandon Willman of BWS Architects. Presentation included: fire damage to the roof-installation of wood railing; back patio-repair of rafters; salvage tiles for later use; replace wood stairs to the sleeping porch; interior remodel: Add more uses for the home to make it a community center for events, conferences. Change bedrooms into toilets. On the north side-change storeroom to bathroom, restore plaster and woodwork, replace wood on the attic and clean the attic space. Exterior elevation-patio to be renovated to a meeting space, improve utilities, new lighting and add fire sprinklers.

The subcommittee members had questions and comments about the project. Comments included availability of historic photograph to inform roofing. Presenters noted none was available but have photos to show how the courtyard was infilled. Inquiry to retain mission-style features in the interior. Need for design to be compatible and not remove all sense of history. Will older bricks be reused? Need to differentiate on major exterior changes especially mission tile, pavers and staircase should be built in a way that is sensitive to its existing design.

Discussion was held. No action was taken.

3c. TP-PRE-0824-00193, 380 S Meyer Avenue

Teatro Carmen – Rehabilitation.

Courtesy Review/Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone.

Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Taku provided background on the proposed project, noting that the subcommittee had previously reviewed some aspects of this multi-phase project. Staff indicated that this is a Pima County project that will not be returning for any further review. Finally, it was emphasized that the review was limited to roof repairs with in-kind materials.

The project was presented by Drew Cook, architect from PMM and Martyn Klell, contractor on behalf of Pima County. Presenters provided an overview of the history of the building, historical research on the use of the Teatro Carmen with photos and maps, status of the depilated roof, work done on the façades and proposed changes, clarified points, and answered questions during the presentation. Presenter described scope of work to include removing and rebuilding the entire roof with modern materials, adding a hip roof on the front; using prefabricated trusses in the middle; building the back out of CMU, installing scuppers to drain water into sidewalk, reusing any and all salvageable materials, and ensuring that the roof is not visible from the street.

Discussion was held. The board asked clarifying questions, and the consensus was support for the proposed roof work. No action was taken.

- 3d. **TP-PRE-0624-00143, 800 N Country Club Action**
Benedictine Monastery [PAD/HL]: New multi-family residential buildings, parking garage and office building. La Rosa Performing Art Center.
Courtesy Review/Sam Hughes National Historic District
Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

[Note: Commissioner Christopher left the meeting at 3:08 PM]

Staff Taku provided background on the proposed project, noting that the subcommittee had previously reviewed some proposed rehabilitation on the Benedictine Monastery. Staff stated that the current review is for the use of the Chapel spaces as a performing center and a new restaurant. The Monastery is a city-designated Historic Landmark constructed by Roy Place.

Architect Charles Pifer from PMM provided an overview of the proposed changes, clarified points, and answered questions during the presentation. Presenter described the scope of work to include a concert space, bar, bathroom area, landscaping, enclosed courtyard cover, lighting at façade, replace doors and windows to match arched profile of existing, guard rails, and shop-built steel and glass door matching appearance of existing windows.

Discussion was held. Feedback from the subcommittee included but not limited to

- On the east end of the courtyard, where the glazing is set right behind the arch wall, recommend “pushing” that back if possible.
- Suggest pulling that glazing back on the rear wall, as Commissioner Christopher indicated already.
- Address and consider the ADA access points with all factors considered.
- Try to figure out how to address ADA access points while preserving the building.
- If there is table seating, suggesting no skylight.

No action was taken.

4. **Public and Institutional Use in a Development Zone Discussion**

- 4a. **Discussion on the use of Public and Institutional buildings as comparative properties in Development Zones**

Due to time constraints this item was not discussed.

5. **Task Force on Inclusivity Report Recommendations**

- 5a. **Discussion on Best Practices for Naming of City- and County-Owned Physical Assets**

Due to time constraints this item was not discussed.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

6a. Minor Reviews

Staff Taku provided a summary of recent minor review in West University on the Capstone relocated properties. These reviews were for the crawl space vents for the foundation of the relocated buildings. They included the building from 812 E. Speedway Boulevard to 929 N. Jacobus Avenue; from 814 E Speedway to 926 N. 2nd Avenue; from 818 E Speedway to 925 N. Jacobus Avenue; from 1036 N. Euclid Avenue to 924 N. 2nd Avenue, and from 1040 N. Euclid Avenue to 548 E. 1st Street. Staff will request availability from PRS members for upcoming minor reviews.

6b. Appeals

Staff Taku noted no pending appeal(s).

6c. Zoning Violations

Staff Taku noted that there are ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance and/or in the review process, such as 350 S. Convent Avenue for a door and 819 N. Euclid Avenue for windows and roof.

6d. Review Process Issues

Staff Taku updated PRS on recent changes in PDSD, including Kristina Swallow became the Assistant City Manager, Koren moved to Interim Director, Jodie Brown was no longer with the city, and Maria Gayosso joined the historic preservation team under the leadership of Dan Bursuck. Hiring for a new Historic Preservation Officer is in progress.

7. Summary of Public Comments (Information Only)

No public comment was received by the posted deadline.

8. Future Agenda Items for Upcoming Meetings

Chair Majewski advised that the next scheduled meeting is September 26, 2024. She indicated that quorum is more of a concern lately due to the low number of subcommittee members. Availability for the next scheduled meeting was discussed with the subcommittee members present. Chair Majewski asked Staff Taku to contact the members about a tentative meeting on October 3 instead of September 26 due to a slim quorum. Staff Taku agreed to do this.

9. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 3:31 P.M.