



## Commission on Climate, Energy, and Sustainability Thursday, March 28, 2024, 3:30 PM - 5:00 PM

Office of City Council Ward 6  
3202 E 1st Street  
Tucson, Arizona, 85716  
**Meeting Minutes**

### 1) Call to Order

Meeting called to order at 3:33 by Chair Jim Sell

#### Present:

Alma Lizette Anides Morales	Representative, Mayor's Office
Adriana Bachmann	Representative, Ward 2
Ojas Sanghi	Representative, Ward 3
Jim Sell	Representative, Ward 6
Garrett Weaver	Representative, City Manager
Camila Martins-Bekat	Representative, City Manager, Tucson Electric Power
John Eisele	Representative, City Manager, Environmental Organization Combating & Adapting to Climate Change

#### Staff Members & Guests:

Michael Catanzaro	Energy Manager, Environmental & General Services Department (EGSD)
Kevin Greene	Sustainable Tucson.
Naomi Greene	
Judith Anderson	Greater Tucson Climate Coalition, Citizens Climate Lobby, and Arizonans' for Community Choice.

#### Absent:

Vanessa Gallego	Representative, Ward 1
-----------------	------------------------

### 2) Call to the Audience

Kevin Greene in attendance, on zero waste chair with Sustainable Tucson. Released Zero Waste Road Map. Goal is to reduce discarded materials to Los Reales by 70%-90%. Eliminate waste to fuel, known as pyrolysis. Wants to keep materials in circulation; recycling alone will not eliminate waste. We need to replace single use disposables. Zero Waste can eliminate Greenhouse Gas Emissions through reduction or use of resources, production, and transportation. Has a program that the city can use to reduce waste, including food waste. Addresses high material contamination levels and low reuse. Austin, Washington DC, and Minneapolis are examples of cities that are doing this. Please reach out at [kevin@sustainabletucson.org](mailto:kevin@sustainabletucson.org)

Judith Anderson. Talked on expanding community engagement. Noted that CCES is one forum of engagement. You have been handpicked by M&C as trusted advisors but have little exposure to the public. We had 15 organizations sign onto a proposal. Climate Action Team is about to hire a public

outreach coordinator. Denver has governance, transportation, energy, resource recovery. Proposed tying these points to climate action team itself. Deal with implementation. We have 120+ actions. Public does not know priority. There is a role that the public can play in organizing. Citizens are passionate about energy. Denver has task forces of 120 citizens on a rolling basis. There were 150 applications for 80 open slots. We can give the CAT team a white paper on how to structure this. There are currently one way inputs to influence the process, such as sticky notes, 3-minute speeches. This goes into a black box, there's no discussion of how decisions are made. Asked how the public can help. Asked how to expand outreach.

### **3) Approval of Minutes (Feb 22, Mar 15)**

March 15th.

Comm. Bachmann motioned to approve as amended. Comm. Eisele seconded.

February 22nd.

Comm. Sanghi motioned to approve as amended. Comm. Eisele seconded.

### **4) Report from the Chair**

Chair Sell reported that Boards and Commissions wants attendance records. We'll send the record in. Missing 4 meetings means commissioners are off a commission.

Wright School rainwater harvesting project is starting again. Was blocked in 2020 when covid hit. Scheduling it for May. Needs excavator. Getting student designed rain water harvesting set up.

Next meeting is April 25th. If Ward 6 is convenient. Natalie Shepp will be here to talk about county sustainability.

Comm. Eisele noted he will be absent for that meeting.

Chair Sell reported that Gov. Hobbs office commented on our letter about SB 1195. Gov. Hobbs office does not comment on pending legislation.

### **5) Annual Report 2023**

Comm. Anides Morales wanted to know when individual reports were needed. Chair Sell said by Easter.

Chair Sell will put the microgrid report in the annual report.

Comm. Sell asked the commission if we wanted to put our mailing and email addresses on the report.

Comm. Weaver said he hasn't seen a requirement for email and mailing addresses, for members, in reports.

Comm. Weaver motioned to approve as amended. Comm. Eisele seconded.

### **6) Planning Discussion (Comparison of plans)**

Comm. Eisele reported nothing significant to report.

Chair Sell is working with Comm. Anides Morales, commented on green spaces and community action, it comes down to resilience centers as a focal point, which is where we should be putting our efforts.

Comm. Anides Morales said that Sugar Hill is more active and her and Chair Sell have reached out.

Comm. Sanghi presented a Notion (software program workbook) showing Plan Tucson and Tucson Resilient together. Workforce development and building energy efficiency were called out as opportunities.

Chair Sell commented that we should have people from communities come in, talk about weatherization and retrofits.

Comm. Sanghi let's use our work on TRT and Plan Tucson to recommend policies for M&C.

Comm. Bachmann working on Social Environment in plan Tucson and Climate Leadership & Governance in Tucson Resilient Together. Plan Tucson's Social Environment section includes: housing, public health, public safety, urban agriculture, parks and recreation, education, arts and culture, and governance and participation.

Comm. Bachmann focused on governance, participation and education, as those are the main areas that overlap between the two plans.

The TRT plan emphasizes importance of community input. City has heard for the need, now we need to act. There should be follow up, and check-ins along the way. Provide the public information. TRT heavily emphasized the importance of including the perspective of traditionally underrepresented populations to be part of the planning process, while Plan Tucson did not.

CoT is supposed to look at TRT every four years, not every 10 years like Plan Tucson.

Chair Sell. City has only partially heard the idea of public engagement. We may only have 15 minutes to say something. It's very choreographed. It's a black box. Lack of measures for determining of goals are being reached. Climate Action Plan calls for zero carbon by 2045.

Tucson Resilient Together. Sustainable collaborative infrastructure. They need a team to implement, staff, volunteers.

Comm. Sanghi, they could be doing better. We can support more.

Chair Sell asked, do we have focal points?

Comm. Sanghi said there is need for clarification, indicated the role for CCES is to write letters to M&C.

## **7) Outreach Potential**

Chair Sell. Question is, how do we help with outreach. Should we do that? Assist in the transformation of a sustainable community. We could serve as a resource for planning. We know people in the community.

Comm. Eisele asked Energy Manager Catanzaro for his perspective.

Catanzaro said the item does seem elusive. Third part of charter, is achieving sustainability in the region. We cannot do it as a commission. We need to partner with other organizations. Can we sit in forums, can we co-host a forum on specific issues.

Comm Bachmann suggested to show up to tabling with other orgs as a way to extend the commissions capabilities.

Chair Sell indicated that there was a CCES maintained list of nonprofits in the region. The commission had an Education, Information, and Outreach committee that could be started up again.

Comm. Sanghi indicated that it's hard for the commission to act because of constraints of open meeting law. It would be hard to do something as a commission. Time would be better spent on a citizens task force like Judith was talking about. The commission can get the Mayor and Council's ear. Put together a large climate action citizens task force. Use our voices to drive larger public engagement.

Chair Sell said it's important to engage the public. Simple response sheet surveys and resurrect the mailing list. This will be an ongoing discussion. Next step would be to involve Fatima, get her input.

## **8) Energy Manager Report**

Energy Manager Catanzaro said there are five projects for Climate Pollution Reduction Grant. Monday deadline. Working with the county. Looked at measures that would be eligible for funding.

Energy Efficiencies ~\$44m

Organic waste and recycling ~\$9m

Los Reales methane capture ~\$60m - capture methane and use it in the [bus] fleet.

EV Roadmap ~\$11m - adding charging stations, level 2, strategically located level 3. No transit asks.

Water pumps ~\$11m - variable speed drives. Looks at existing electric. Want redundancies with methane. Theoretically we could use Los Reales methane for that.

~\$135m in total.

Energy Savings looking at ~15% city energy efficiency savings.

\$90m can be reinvested into city. Spending less on debt service.

Building two runways. One is if we get the grant funding. Track two is \$1m in revolving loan fund. Look at using that for lighting efficiency as a back up plan if CoT does not get the grant award.

Comm. Eisele asked if there was a role for the commission to play.

Catanzaro said it's good to promote these ideas. Also look at what grants we can apply for.

### **9) Call to Audience**

Judith Anderson - Meaningful citizens engagement is needed. You can change the format of once monthly meeting. Have another meeting for public outreach workshop. Continue outreach with public. Clearly make recommendations to city leadership. Invite orgs. Public engagement with franchise agreement. TEP paid \$800,000 for the failed prop 412 election.

Naomi Greene - before she retired she did public outreach statewide in Illinois. Suggested The Commission can serve as facilitators. Can serve as resources. There is a role of ward offices, The Commission could move meetings to different ward offices. Invite the media, a lunch, a session to educate the media on plans that are prepared and discussed. Posting content with experts on YouTube. Bilingual churches could be involved.

Kevin Greene - Take a look at GTCCs recommendation to city leaders. There was not much stakeholder engagement in the grant process after the report. You can go to the Mayor's Office and make suggestions on how to engage the public on decisions. Doesn't like learning about things through press releases. You must unify what is happening in Tucson. You can be facilitators and help the Mayor's Office and get feedback from stakeholder groups.

### **10) Future Agenda items**

None.

### **11) Adjournment**

Chair Sell adjourned the meeting at 5:08.