



**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**  
Historic Landscapes Subcommittee  
Legal Action Report

**January 18, 2024**

The Historic Landscapes Subcommittee of the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission conducted a meeting on Thursday, January 18, 2024, at 9:00 a.m. via Zoom.

1. **Call to Order / Roll Call**

Meeting was called to order by Chair Grede at 9:03 a.m. Those present and absent were:

**Members Present:**

Steve Grede, Chair  
Geoffrey Ellwand  
Helen Erickson  
J. J. Lamb (left meeting at 10:58 a.m.)  
Jan Mulder (left meeting at 10:28 a.m.)

**Members Absent:** None

**Guests:**

Jodie Brown, City of Tucson Historic Preservation Officer  
Jasmine Chan, City of Tucson Parks & Recreation  
Stephen Addison, Tucson City Manager's Office  
Amy Peron, Norris Design  
Jason Kuklinski, Norris Design  
Eric Barrett, ARC Studios  
Matt Smith, ARC Studios  
John Burr, Chair – Amory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board

2. **Approval of Historic Landscapes Subcommittee LAR/Minutes from Meeting of: 8-17-2023 (Discussion/Action)**

Commissioner Lamb moved approval of the minutes of the meeting of 8-17-2023 meeting. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Erickson and passed by a roll call vote of 5-0.

3. **Virtual, Hybrid, or In-Person Historic Landscapes Subcommittee Meetings Going**

## **Forward (Discussion/Action)**

Ms. Brown clarified that a Hybrid meeting format necessitates a room large enough to hold in-person participants and a camera to show attendees. It does not need to be a City of Tucson Facility. The agenda and meeting announcement will need to list when the room will be available before the meeting start time. PRS agendas could be a resource. She can book a room with about a weeks' notice.

Commissioner Erickson moved that the HLS meet in a Hybrid format in the future to allow for greatest flexibility. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Mulder and passed by a roll call vote of 5-0.

## **4. Review Cases (Discussion/Action)**

### **a. Activate El Presidio Streetscape Project**

Ms. Peron presented the proposed streetscape project in the El Presidio Historic District.

Commissioner Erickson requested that the TPCHC PRS be brought back into the review process at the end of the three-year sunset period for the installation. It was clarified that the street and sidewalk paint could be power washed to remove, left as is, or repainted at that time.

Commissioner Mulder reported that the City's Shared Space Guidelines were never reviewed by the TPCHC PRS, and it would be appropriate for their review for historic considerations. Review of the guidelines will be added to a future HLS agenda.

Commissioner Erickson commended Ms. Peron on the clear and informative presentation and moved to support the plan to activate the Presidio district as a temporary installation with the following provisos:

- that there be a clear distinction made between permanent installations and temporary installations (noting the seat wall and pavement paint)
- that at the time of the sunset date in three years the project be brought back to the Commission for additional review.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Lamb and passed by a roll call vote of 5-0.

## **5. Current Issues for Information (Discussion/Action)**

### **a. Reid Park Masterplan**

Ms. Chan reported that the masterplan will be scheduled for final Mayor and Council approval now that the Randolph Opportunity Study is complete. A date has not been scheduled. There is no intention for the masterplan to be reviewed.

Commissioner Grede asked if the HLS could review and comment on the masterplan and offered to schedule a meeting to accommodate their schedule. Ms. Chan will ask.

b. Armory Park Masterplan

Ms. Chan reported that there was an introductory meeting with HLS members and that a courtesy review of the plan will be presented at Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) 1-20-2024 meeting.

Mr. Smith asked that Armory Park and Children's Museum block with playground be reviewed separately. He presented the preliminary design.

Mr. Barrett presented that the existing lighting would be retained and reworked.

Commissioner Grede commended the presenters on the retention of historic plantings such as the Italian cypress allées and replacement of perimeter trees with in-kind species; the removing of gates and replacement with bollards to reduce parking within the park; relocating the bandshell/performance stage location to the central location facing the historic Carnegie block; the addition of parking in the non-historic northeast location on the block. He expressed his opinion that fencing of the dog park interrupts the historic circulation and openness of the park; and would impact the historic function of the park for events, rallies, and public gatherings.

Commissioner Lamb thanked the presenters for a strong design that respects the historic form of the park.

Commissioner Erickson commended the team for a design that is sensitive to the historic, city-beautiful design of the park and succession planting of the trees. She suggested that Wenger Corp. might be a resource for a temporary stage, as considered for the Tucson Convention Center.

She moved that

- The overall plan reflects the historic design of the park, including the location of the stage
- While the potential dog park is set in an appropriate location, the visual intrusion of fencing will significantly separate that area from the park to the detriment of the overall design. Temporary fencing, removeable for large

public events in the park, is preferred. If fencing were to be installed, it should be as transparent as possible, and turf in the dog park would also help to preserve visual continuity.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Lamb and passed by a roll call vote of 4-0 (Commissioner Mulder had left the meeting).

c. Armory Park Masterplan – Children’s Museum Block

Commissioner Grede expressed concern for the seat wall that interrupts the historic open space and form of the park, the curved planting areas to the north, and use of artificial turf.

Commissioner Erickson commended the team for not fencing the playground which would have a greater impact on the City Beautiful design of the space. Perhaps benches could be utilized instead of a seat wall, and natural turf would help to preserve continuity.

Mr. Barrett asked if the HLS was in favor of a playground area on the north side of the Children’s Museum block. Commissioner Grede responded that the playground is a non-historic element in a historic landscape. It is less intrusive if the design and elements respect the historic form and open space and is temporary in nature/reversible. Commissioner Erickson suggested that a walkway may serve as a visual barrier/space definition instead of the seat wall.

Commissioner Grede moved that the space retains its Beaux Artes/City Beautiful form with paths from the corners, the north row of trees reflecting the historic row of trees, and that the playground is not fenced. Areas of concern include the breaking up the ground plane and visual continuity with a seat wall, proposed artificial turf, and three curving/semi-circular forms to the north. Commissioner Erickson seconded, and the motion was passed by a roll call vote of 3-0 (Commissioners Mulder and Lamb had left the meeting).

d. Drachman Motels- Tucson Inn, El Rancho Motor Hotel, and Frontier Motel, Miracle Mile District

Nothing to report at this time.

e. Issues for collaboration between Transportation Subcommittee and Historic Landscapes Subcommittee

Nothing to report at this time.

- f. Historic Landscape Subcommittee's possible role in researching, nominating, and reviewing rural and cultural landscapes.

Nothing to report at this time.

- g. Followup on Villa Catalina replacement of turf with artificial turf.

Commissioner Grede will follow up with Rachelle Hornby to determine the status of the grant.

**6. Future Agenda Items for Upcoming Meetings**

City's Shared Space Guidelines.

**7. Call to the Audience (Information Only)**

No comments were received by the deadline.

**8. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:06 a.m.