

2023

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission  
Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS)

LEGAL ACTION REPORT/Minutes

Thursday, October 12, 2023

Pursuant to safe practices during the COVID-19 pandemic, all in-person meetings are cancelled until further notice. This meeting was held virtually to allow for healthy practices and social distancing. The meeting was accessible at provided link to allow for participating virtually and/or calling in.

Note: A recording of the entire meeting (audio/video) can be accessed at <https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLUfRGd7RxAUv6rMbRNEurjg1iY8N4ZALR>

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

The meeting was called to order at 1:04 P.M., and per roll call, a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Teresita Majewski (Chair), Jan Mulder, Carol Griffith, Joel Ireland, Savannah McDonald, Rikki Riojas

Commissioners Absent: None

Applicants/Public Present: Rose Holstad Irene, Greg Clark, Rory Juneman, Robin Large [Lazarus & Silyn PC], Rick Bright, Marco Schreier, Jennifer Levstik, Jill Heather, Paul Reimer, John Burr, and Elaine Hill.

Staff Present: Jodie Brown, Michael Taku (Planning and Development Services Department [PDSD])and Donny Russell(Parks &Recreational Department)

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report/Minutes for the Meeting of September 14, 2023

**Motion:** It was moved by Commissioner Rojas to approve the Legal Action Report/Minutes for the meeting of September 14, 2023, as submitted.

Commissioner Ireland seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously by a roll call vote of 6-0.

4. National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) Nomination

4a. **Barrio San Antonio**

Southwest of downtown Tucson's core and south of the University of Arizona

National Register Criterion A  
Period of Significance 1912 to 1973

**\*Note:** *At the request of the applicant and concurred by PRS, this case was reviewed out of sequence.*

Staff Brown introduced the nomination proposal and read into the record the public comment from Greg Clark.

Jennifer Levstik, Nomination Preparer presented the nomination and answered relevant questions.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

**Motion:** It was moved by Commissioner Mulder to support the National Register Nomination of Barrio San Antonio with a condition to include Greg Clark's comment letter when forwarding the Nomination to SHPO and suggest inclusion of the bounding street names in Figure 3 and if possible, on the Photo Point Map.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Griffith.

The motion passed unanimously by a roll call vote of 6-0.

### 3. **Historic Preservation Review Cases**

*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines  
Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines*

#### 3a. **SD-0223-00027, 5360 E Fort Lowell Road (Continued)**

Construction of a new perimeter wall and landscaping remodel  
Full review/Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone  
Contributing Historic to HPZ/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Brown presented background on the project, which had been heard by the Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board [FHZAB] on 02/28/23, voted 3-1 to recommend approval with conditions; 09/26/23, voted 7-0 to recommend approval with conditions. PRS first heard the case on 4/27/23 and voted 5-0 to recommend continuing the review process. On 9/14/23, PRS reviewed the case and voted 6-0 to remand the case to the FLHZAB and then back to the PRS. At the October 3, 2023, meeting the FHZAB voted 5-1 to recommended approval (after modifying the motion) with several conditions: (1) that the front wall does not exceed four feet in height except surrounding the front gate; (2) that the fence proposed along the east lot line is metal as shown on the submitted plans; (3) that the fence along the west lot line is a mixture of both masonry and metal materials;(4) that the masonry sections of the west perimeter wall are meandering, "lumpy," and vary between three and five feet in height, and not to exceed five feet in height; (5) that the southern portion of the west perimeter wall is five feet in height with metal paneling in-between the wall sections; (6) that the owner retain a rural quality of the property; (7) that the color of the proposed perimeter walls are reviewed during construction as a courtesy

review; (8) that the proposed metal fencing rusticate; (9) that the distance between the fence pickets will vary between two and four inches; (10) that the front gate is six feet in height and is not intended to set precedence for other properties within the Preservation Zone; (11) that the overall project will be organic; (12) that the opening within the gate maintain visual access to the rear of the property; (13) that all references to future work are removed from the submitted plans; (14) that the locations of the motor vehicle parking be removed from the submitted plans; and (15) that the proposed landscaping is not within the purview of this specific review.

Paul Reimer, architect, presented the project along with property owner Jill Heather.

Discussion was held. PRS affirmed the majority of FLHZAB's recommendations. Action was taken.

**Motion:** It was moved by Commissioner Ireland to recommend approval with the following conditions: that the front masonry wall does not exceed four feet in height, except surrounding the front gate; that the fence proposed around the east lot line is metal as shown on the submitted plans; that the fence along the west lot line is a mixture of both masonry and metal materials, the masonry or solid sections of the West perimeter wall are meandering, "lumpy" and vary between three and five feet in height; that the southern portion of the west perimeter wall is five feet in height, with metal paneling in between the wall sections; that the owner retain a rural quality to the property; that the color of the proposed perimeter walls will be reviewed during the construction process as a courtesy review; that the proposed metal fencing rusticate; that the distance between the fence pickets is in between two and four inches; that the front gate is six feet in height and is not intended to set precedence for other properties within the Historic Preservation Zone; that the overall project will be organic; that the opening within the gate maintain visual access to the rear of the property; that all references to future work are removed from the submitted plans; that the locations of the motor vehicle parking were not reviewed as a part of this review; and that the proposed landscaping was not reviewed as a part of this review. It was amended by Chair Majewski to include the reduction of the massing of the masonry wall surrounding the front gate as a condition. Commissioner Ireland agreed with the amendment.

Commissioner Riojas seconded the motion.

The motion passed with a roll call vote of 5-1. (Commissioner Mulder dissented citing discomfort with equating a perimeter wall to a pool wall and feels there a more historically compatible ways to handle this and left it to the Planning Director to come up with a way of balancing competing interests.)

- 3b. ~~\*SD-1222-00010, 620 N 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue~~  
Replace 2<sup>nd</sup> floor balcony railing, relocate front door.

This item had been removed from the agenda.

**3c. TP-PRE-0923-00327, 847 N Stone Avenue**

Adaptive reuse of the existing historic buildings. Proposed offices and café.  
Courtesy Review/Miracle Mile National Register Historic District  
Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Brown provided background.

Roy Juneman along with Robin Large (Lazarus & Silvyn PC) and Rick Bright presented the project.

Discussion was held. No action was taken.

**3d. \*SD-0923-00102, 2900 N Craycroft Road**

Improvements to the existing pony field, including new sports field lighting.  
Full Review/Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone  
Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Brown provided background. The Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board (FLHZAB) heard the case on 9/26/23 and voted 7-0 to recommend approval with conditions: that a tree native to the Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone is proposed rather than an Arizona Rosewood.

Donny Russell, Project Manager (Park & Recreational Department) presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

**Motion:** It was moved by Commissioner Mulder to recommend approval as presented.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Griffith.

The motion passed unanimously by a roll call vote of 6-0.

**5. Task Force on Inclusivity Report Recommendations**

**4a. Discussion on Best Practices for Naming of City- and County-Owned Physical Assets**

No report was given.

**6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion**

**6a. Minor Reviews**

Staff Taku and Commissioner Ireland reported on the onsite recent minor reviews as follows: A roof replacement at 317 E 1<sup>st</sup> Street (West University). Solar

panels at 720 S 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue; a steel container/shed at 218 E 17<sup>th</sup> Street, and a roof replacement at 408 E 16<sup>th</sup> Street ( all in Armory Park. Staff Taku will call for availability for any upcoming minor reviews.

**6b. Appeals**

Staff Taku noted that there is a pending appeal for 5259 East Fort Lowell Road which was submitted by the FLHZAB. The appeal is not yet scheduled to be heard by the Mayor and Council and will likely be heard sometime in November or in early December.

**6c. Zoning Violations**

Staff Taku noted that there are ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance and/or in the review process, and that staff are working with their zoning violation code enforcement liaison.

**6d. Review Process Issues**

None

**7. Summary of Public Comments (Information Only)**

One public comment was received by the posted deadline and read into the record.

**8. Future Agenda Items for Upcoming Meetings**

The next scheduled meeting is October 24, 2023. Staff Brown noted that potential cases include two in the Fort Lowell HPZ and other cases in West University and Armory Park. There are some courtesy review cases and a National Register Nomination, for Campus Farms.

**9. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:25 P.M.