



West University Historic Zone Advisory Board
Tuesday, September 19, 2023, at 6:00PM
Virtual Meeting
Meeting Minutes/Legal Action Report

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Meeting Opened 6:02 pm

Board Members Attending: McDonnell, Serra, Turner, and Glock

Guests: Jodie Brown (COT HPO), Jose Rincon, Randel Jacob, and Maritza DiCenso

2. Approval of Minutes – August 15, 2023

Approval of 8/15/23 Minutes: Jim motioned to approve. Rachel seconded. Approved by roll call vote 4-0.

3. Call to Audience

None

4. Reviews

a. SD-1222-00010, 620 N 6th Avenue-Continued

Replace 2nd floor balcony railing, relocate front door.
Full Review/Contributing Resource

Jose Rincon (owner) presenting. Presentation and the discussion were focused on the balcony railing that was installed without historic review or permits. This represents the 3rd conversation/review with the board on this topic.

Jose walked the board through some photographic history of the property and gave an overview of the thought process that led to the decision to proceed with the design and installation that is in place today. Jose explained that the process to obtain historic review and approval was longer than he expected and that his project timeline allowed. He sought the advice of an out of state supplier who had some experience with historic reproductions and provided some photographic examples of the railing used on the interior staircase of the property as a suggestion to the supplier. Jose also said he was not inclined to replace a railing that he just spent \$20,000 to install.

In the discussion that followed, the board re-iterated that the photographic evidence showed and original railing design that we less ornate than the one the owner has now installed. Also, that the currently installed railing was not consistent with the design intent of the building and distracted from and conflicted with the mission revival design elements in the building façade. Specific comments were that the rail posts had inset panels not consistent with the original and the scale of the posts was larger than the original and not consistent with the first-floor columns. Also, the installed balusters were too ornate and not consistent with the original. Photo from inventory sheet and other historic photos of the building show simple square or cylindrical balusters.

It also came up during the discussion that the installed railing is made from polyurethane, not wood. Board recollection was that the presenter at the last board meeting indicated the railing was wood. Turner reminded the owner that wood is the preferred material and any deviation from wood would be another item to bring back to this board for approval.

Damon motioned to decline proposed railing. Rachel seconded. The board approved motion 4-0.

After the motion was approved, the owner was given an explanation of the process going forward and that there could be an opportunity to present his argument to the plans review subcommittee.

b. SD-0623-00071, 220 E Speedway

New fence and access gate. Exterior door and window replacement. Asphalt removal and replacement. Landscape replacement.
Full Review/Contributing Resource

Randel Jacob and Maritza DiCenso presenting.

Randel began by giving project overview and explained that the original intent of the project was to enhance security for the property by installing a perimeter fence. Building has been vandalized in the recent past. Also desire to add ADA compliant access. Parking lot repair and landscaping. Want to replace all doors and windows.

Not changing style or footprint or window/door openings of the historic building. Some/many of the existing windows and doors are not original and the exact style of the original mullions in the windows and doors are not known. Intent is also to remove all the security bars on the windows.

Desire is for a 6-foot-tall fence along Speedway because of the security concerns. Wrought iron pickets, more than 50% transparent, not obstructing the view of the building from the street. Discussion regarding fence included the setback from Speedway of the proposed fence. As presented, it is shown in the ROW. Suggestion from board that better pedestrian access through the ROW would be

preferred. Also, suggestion that 2' masonry wall would not be required/desired although general acceptance of 6' height for security purposes.

Doors and windows all would be aluminum clad wood. All existing window sills would be preserved although that is not completely reflected on the drawing. Discussion of mullions resulted in acceptance of the prairie style proposed.

Discussion of the ADA ramps. Suggestion that proposed railings be attached only to slab, not the historic structure.

Jim motioned to approve windows and doors (style and material) as proposed. ADA ramps should not be attached to the building, just the slab. Remove 2' wall from fence and the fence can be 6 feet. Window sills as proposed. Prefer moving fence to the south to allow an 8' setback from the curb.

Rachel seconds. Board approves 4-0.

5. Staff Updates - Information Only

Jodie informed the board the M&C voted to keep the Tucson/Pima County Historic Commission intact as a joint commission.

6. Future Agenda Items

None identified.

7. Adjournment

Motion made by Jim to adjourn. Motion approved unanimously, 4-0. Meeting adjourned at 7:33 pm.

Rick McDonnell, Chair / Darci Hazelbaker, Secretary