

2023

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT/Minutes

Thursday, March 9, 2023

Pursuant to safe practices during the COVID-19 pandemic, all in-person meetings are cancelled until further notice. This meeting was held virtually to allow for healthy practices and social distancing. The meeting was accessible at provided link to allow for participating virtually and/or calling in.

Note: A recording of the entire meeting (audio/video) can be accessed at <https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLUfRGd7RxAUv6rMbRNEurjg1iY8N4ZALR>

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:01 P.M., and per roll call, a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Carol Griffith, Savannah McDonald, Jan Mulder, Rikki Riojas

Commissioners Excused/Joined Late: Joel Ireland (joined at 1:03 P.M.)

Applicants/Public Present: Eric Barrett (ARC Studios), Michael Boren (property owner/developer for 3a), Jim Sauer (Scott Neely Architecture), Rachel Serra (RAS Architecture), Michael Shiner (property owner/developer for 3b)

Staff Present: Jodie Brown and Michael Taku (both Planning and Development Services Department [PDSD])

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report/Minutes for the Meeting of January 26, 2023

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Riojas to approve the Legal Action Report/Minutes for the meeting of January 26, 2023, as submitted.

Commissioner Griffith seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously by a roll call vote of 6-0.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

3a. SD-0223-00022, 211 S. 4th Avenue

Change of use from residence to bed and breakfast and special event venue.
Full Review/Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone
Contributing Resource/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Brown provided background on this case. The case was heard at the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) meeting of February 21, 2023, but the minutes have not yet been completed. The APHZAB chair had provided the motion to Staff Brown, and APHZAB's motion to approve change of use passed 7-0. Architect Rachel Serra (RAS Architecture) presented the case, and owner Michael Boren was also present and answered questions.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Griffith to recommend approval of the change of use as presented.

Commissioner Riojas seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously by a roll call vote of 6-0.

3b. SD-0123-00013, 275 E. 18th Street
Flexible Lot Development with construction of 6 new homes.
Full Review/Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone
Vacant Lots/Rehabilitation Standards

Staff Brown provided background on this Flexible Lot Development (FLD) case. The case was heard at the APHZAB meeting of February 21, 2023, but the minutes have not yet been completed. The APHZAB chair had provided the motion to Staff Brown, and it was read into the record. An APHZAB board member made a motion to recommend conceptually the FLD lot lines, setbacks, tentative streetscape facing elevations, plans as presented for Herbert Avenue pedestrian improvements, retention as possible of historic curbs and sidewalks on south 4th Avenue and 18th Street; however, the project when designed must come back for a full review of all buildings, elevations and materials for approval. The project was recommended for approval with a vote of 7 to 0. Staff Brown clarified that the Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS) saw the same plans as reviewed by APHZAB. PRS previously did a courtesy review for this project. Plans were completed for FLD review but not for historic review. The applicant hopes that today PRS will be able to weigh in on the placement of buildings on the lot, and if the FLD plan is approved, applicant will return for a full review of the buildings, elevations, and materials. Architect Jim Sauer (Scott Neely Architecture), Michael Shiner (owner/developer), and Eric Barrett (ARC Studios) presented the case.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Mulder to recommend approval of the conceptual flexible lot design lot lines; the setbacks as presented, that is, waiving the standard setback requirements; the conceptual streetscape elevations; and

the plans as presented for Herbert Avenue pedestrian improvements. We recommend retention of the existing sidewalks and historic curbs along 4th Avenue and 18th Street to the extent possible, and do not recommend sidewalks and curbs along Herbert Avenue. The project, when fully designed, should come back to PRS for full review of all buildings, elevations, and materials.

Commissioner Griffith seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously by a roll call vote of 6-0.

4. Task Force on Inclusivity Report Recommendations

4a. Discussion on Best Practices for Naming of City- and County-Owned Physical Assets

Chair Majewski noted that she hopes to have a revised draft for review by Commissioners Griffith and Riojas soon.

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

5a. Minor Reviews

Staff Taku reported that there have been 10 minor reviews since the last meeting, and Commissioner Riojas or Chair Majewski assisted with these reviews. Three were in the Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone, one at 53 W. Kennedy, one at 56 W. Kennedy, and one at 186 W. Simpson, all for solar panels. One minor review was conducted in the Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone, for solar panels at 5483 E. Placita del Mesquite. In the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone, minor reviews were conducted at 133 E. 17th for solar panels, at 520 E. 18th Street for a new door, light fixtures, and modification to gable ends and rafter tails/eaves, and at 749 S. 4th Avenue for replacement of a garage door with a pedestrian door and side lights. Signs were reviewed at 845 E. University (West University Historic Preservation Zone), 108 E. Congress (Downtown Historic District), and 305 N. 4th Avenue (4th Avenue Commercial Historic District). Staff Taku noted that there are no pending minor reviews.

5b. Appeals

Staff Taku noted that there are no current appeals.

5c. Zoning Violations

Staff Taku noted that there are ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance and/or in the review process, and that staff is working with their zoning violation code enforcement liaison. There are two or three in the West University Historic Preservation Zone and two in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone. He will update the subcommittee when more information is available.

5d. Review Process Issues

Staff Brown noted that Staff Taku would be out of the office from March 13 through March 31. The FLD process was discussed, and all agreed it was a productive discussion. Commissioners also noted that the process needs to be better coordinated so that the applicants don't have to have so many meetings at different points in the process, or, at the very least, the applicant is clearly informed of the need for full historic review following FLD approval. Chair Majewski asked what the circumstances were that both February PRS meetings were cancelled. Staff Brown noted that no cases were ready for review, probably in part due to the fact that no advisory board meetings were held over the holidays.

6. Summary of Public Comments (Information Only)

No public comments were received by the deadline.

7. Future Agenda Items for Upcoming Meetings

The next scheduled meeting had been March 23, 2023, but there are quorum issues on that date. It was moved by mutual agreement to March 30, 2023. Upcoming cases may include courtesy reviews for the language on a plaque for the Teatro Carmen and on a sign for Time Market. There also may be a review for a project in the Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone.

8. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:13 P.M.