
Upon roll call, those present and absent were:

Commission Members Present:

Alexa Scholl, Chairperson	City Manager
Jennifer Garcia	City Manager
Laura Dent	City Manager
Agustin Urquidi	City Manager
Thomas Warne	City Manager

Commission Members Absent:

Greg Facey	City Manager
Nicholas Nieri-Lang	City Manager

Staff Members Present:

Jesus Acedo, City Records Manager, City Clerk's Office
Rene Figueroa, Administrative Assistant, City Clerk's Office

=====
(TRANSCRIBER'S NOTE: THROUGHOUT THE TRANSCRIPT, MR. URQUIDI FORGETS TO PUSH THE MICROPHONE BUTTON TO SPEAK. THEREFORE, HIS COMMENTS HAVE NOT BEEN RECORDED IN A TIMELY FASHION AND MOST ARE INAUDIBLE.)

1 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay. I'm gonna call this meeting to
2 order. Today is Thursday, February 9th, 2023. It is 5:31 P.M. And
3 this is a meeting of the City of Tucson Citizens' Commission on Public
4 Service and Compensation. Can we do roll call, please?

5 MR. FIGUEROA: Laura Dent?

6 MS. DENT: Here.

7 MR. FIGUEROA: Greg Facey? He will be absent. Jennifer
8 Garcia?

9 MS. GARCIA: Here.

10 MR. FIGUEROA: Nicholas Nieri-Lang? Absent. Alexa Scholl?

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Here.

12 MR. FIGUEROA: Agustin Urquidi?

13 MR. URQUIDI: Here.

14 MR. FIGUEROA: Thomas Warne?

1 MR. WARNE: Here.

2 MR. FIGUEROA: And with that, we have a quorum. Thank you
3 very much.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Thank you. Moving on to Item 2.
5 Approval of the Meeting Minutes, LAR from February 2nd, 2023. I
6 believe we all received these yesterday, and have a copy in front of
7 us. Do I have a motion to approve the LAR?

8 MR. WARNE: So moved.

9 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Do I hear a second?

10 MR. URQUIDI: (Inaudible)

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: We have a motion and a second. All in
12 favor say "aye".

13 (Affirmative.)

14 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Any opposed? Passes five-zero.
15 Moving on to Item 3. Review Data and Develop Commission
16 Recommendation. So, looks like we have some new information in front
17 of us that I was provided by the Clerk's Office relating to the top
18 five populated cities in Arizona, and then also cities of comparable
19 sizes in other states. I know we had wanted this information to kind
20 of help guide us. Any thoughts or research that you all did over the
21 past week that you'd like to discuss? Yes. Tom?

22 MR. WARNE: I, I just (inaudible) confirmed some of it.
23 I looked up budget sizes.

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

1 MR. WARNE: And, you know, so, what, what are the
2 responsibilities, you know, budget-wise which are huge, you know,
3 being responsibilities are huge. And the - I looked up Pima County.
4 I'm very familiar with the Supervisors' salaries. And their budget's
5 just a little bit less than the City of Tucson. They're around one
6 nine something, and we're over two. We're about just almost two one.

7 And then, seeing this tonight, I went ahead and looked up
8 Albuquerque, and their budget's much less than ours. And then I saw
9 the Ph- -- you know, the Phoenix numbers, which just personally
10 speaking, they're more, more than what I would like to see. And their
11 budget is much less than ours, you know, 'cause they have all the
12 surrounding towns and, you know, County's almost totally incorporated.

13 So, I just wanted to point that out, that, you know, all of
14 those, of those three, most comparable, meaning Pima County, this one
15 right here, but all the budgets are less than our budget.

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: That's good information. Thank you.
17 Other thoughts or research on that you want to share? Laura, any
18 insights from your last time doing this?

19 MS. DENT: I mean I would just say that we're obviously
20 behind from comparable cities, but also just like our peers across the
21 state. So, I, I just feel like we've gotta do something respectable
22 in order to make sure that like folks that, you know, aren't
23 independently wealthy can do this work. But aside from that, no,
24 I'm just eager to (inaudible) where folks are at and discuss further.

1 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Thank you. Jesus and Rene, I have a
2 question. I think last time I had asked if we were able to suggest a
3 formula as opposed to a hard number. I don't know if you guys were
4 able to get any information about that.

5 MR. ACEDO: We were. So, a formula can be established to
6 establish the salary increase recommendation. However, it can lead
7 into future commission years. So, it can be a formula that, for
8 example, ties the hands of the future commission in order for them to
9 make an appropriate recommendation. So, it can be like, your
10 recommendation can be to take (inaudible) salary adjusted for
11 inflation, and that's your -

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

13 MR. ACEDO: - recommended increase. However, the
14 recommendation can be - can't be for this formula to be used in the
15 future as well.

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

17 MS. DENT: Followup question.

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

19 MS. DENT: I mean the way that I hear that would be that
20 you could make a recommendation around a formula tying it to
21 inflation, but not necessarily like proscribed future councils from -
22 or future committees from making that change, because my understanding
23 is that if you did tie it to inflation, it really wouldn't make sense
24 for that to then stop, you know, two years within the future. Does
25 that sound right?

1 MR. FIGUEROA: Correct.

2 MS. DENT: Okay.

3 MR. FIGUEROA: Yes.

4 MS. DENT: Great. Thank you so much.

5 MR. FIGUEROA: You're welcome.

6 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: I'm just thinking some sort of formula
7 might help, 'cause clearly it takes a lot of effort to put together a
8 recommendation that the voters then pass in 20 whatever years. So,
9 tying it to some formula allows for there to be some natural increases
10 without having to go back every time to the voters.

11 So, I would definitely be interested in including that just
12 so that we don't get so far behind again. So, that there's a
13 Commission 20 years from now, you know, having the same problems we
14 are now.

15 MR. ACEDO: So, this Commission meets biannually. So,
16 whenever the City holds elections, and those happen in odd-numbered
17 years. So, through even-numbered years, the Commission doesn't
18 convene and there's no recommendation made.

19 It has happened in the past as well where the Commission
20 elects not to give the Mayor and Council the increase, so that has,
21 has happened as well.

22 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, Tom, last time you had said that
23 you would like to see the number be the, at least the average wage.
24 Is that what you were saying for the City?

1 MR. WARNE: Yes. The average wage that we have in the
2 book. I think it was fifty-some thousand.

3 MR. URQUIDI: Yeah.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Fifty-six?

5 MR. WARNE: Right. So, that, you know, not that, not that
6 the amount of work and so on -

7 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

8 MR. WARNE: - is, you know, average.

9 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

10 MR. WARNE: You know, 'cause dealing with Council quite a
11 bit, it's the responses that the constituents think (inaudible)

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

13 MR. WARNE: - the time frame they expect it in is not
14 average to me anyhow.

15 MR. URQUIDI: (Inaudible)

16 MR. WARNE: It's - well, I, I read it in, in the handout.

17 MR. URQUIDI: Oh.

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Under Tab E.

19 MR. WARNE: Yes. City that, you know, posted some of the
20 economic data.

21 MS. DENT: It sounds like the full-time median income
22 versus the general median, 'cause a median income is just really,
23 unfortunately quite low because there's a mix of part-time employees
24 and non-workers.

25 MR. WARNE: Right.

1 MS. DENT: Right, Tom?

2 MR. WARNE: Yeah. And so this was average, though, not
3 median. Right. Full-time, right. That's how I took it, and I agree.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, potentially like a number in that
5 range, plus some sort of inflation (inaudible) a formula?

6 MR. WARNE: Yes. And then with the Mayor making more than
7 that. And looking at the handout that Staff gave us tonight, which is
8 great, I always look at like how do we get the votes?

9 And look- -- so, Phoenix, when I looked up their budget
10 size, I was shocked that it was smaller than ours. But I know that,
11 you know, the whole place is incorporated, you know, -

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

13 MR. WARNE: - these towns run into each other. So, but I
14 think the average voter might think like me, I don't know, that, hey,
15 Phoenix, they're a big place. that's a huge place. So, you know - so,
16 if any, if anyone looks it up, or they fight us, if they oppose us,
17 and, you know, they're at six-one five ninety-nine. So, it's a little
18 more than I (inaudible) I think we should, should be lower. And I
19 know that's subjective. What I'm saying to you, all might disagree.
20 But I'm also trying to think how we get this passed.

21 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

22 MR. ACEDO: Yeah. The, the consideration, I think, there's
23 a lot of factors here. They're - the factor is, you know, relative to
24 the budget, to the decision-making, to the median income. What other
25 cities, the comparable? And then if our job is to take into

1 consideration whether it's going - the voters are going to pass it,
2 then we have to factor that in, and how much we're, we're going to
3 recommend.

4 Or is our job just to recommend and then just leave it
5 to the voters to decide? So, I, I guess I'm just asking an open
6 question.

7 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

8 MS. DENT: I mean it feels like the general sentiment is
9 that this is long overdue, and that we want to see this move forward
10 and voters to approve it.

11 MR. URQUIDI: Oh, yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

13 MS. DENT: Which I'm glad to hear. I feel like that's
14 pretty (inaudible)

15 MR. URQUIDI: Well, since 1999, -

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

17 MR. URQUIDI: - there hasn't been an increase, right?

18 MS. DENT: I mean it's really -

19 MR. URQUIDI: Yeah.

20 MS. DENT: It's criminal. So, I, I, I do feel like we
21 should be mindful of how the voters are gonna receive this package.
22 I do feel very heartened by how close we got in 2021.

23 I think folks recognize and appreciate that this is overdue
24 and I think hopefully, you know, outside of this body, I would love to
25 continue conversations with this group and other community leaders on

1 how we can rate the profile of this issue because it continues to be a
2 barrier for anyone that's running for office.

3 I wanted to touch quickly on Tom's point. I agree just to
4 kind of create some like bumpers for moving the conversation forward.
5 I agree that like Phoenix should be the ceiling. I do think that
6 that's a good point.

7 I like the idea of tying an index to the median earning of
8 a full-time employee in this MSA. I am noticing that it is
9 significantly higher for men than for women. It's 50,769 for men and
10 41,000 for women.

11 So, that's like an awkward campaign slogan. (Inaudible)
12 tie it to the full-time men in your region. But I do feel like if
13 we're going with one of those figures, we, we should lean towards the
14 higher.

15 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

16 MS. DENT: That's just my opinion.

17 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: I agree with that.

18 MS. GARCIA: I agree with that.

19 MR. WARNE: And, and more women vote than men. I'm very
20 sensitive to gender equality, so, I couldn't agree with you more.
21 And we might be able to get some more women out to vote for it.

22 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Now did we establish if our City
23 Council is working full-time or part-time?

24 MS. GARCIA: From what I remember last time, there is no
25 indication that it is more one or the other.

1 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

2 MS. GARCIA: I think from, anecdotally from those who have
3 worked with Council Members, it tends to be more of a full-time job
4 than a, than a part-time gig. And that was something that we had, a
5 reason we had extended the invitation to the Mayor and Council to
6 attend these meetings if they'd like to share some insight.

7 And then, may have - I think it was Greg had asked for some
8 information. I think it was him. On, if we could poll the Council
9 Members and see if they could provide us with like the average number
10 of hours they're working a week on (inaudible)

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

12 MS. GARCIA: Yeah.

13 MS. DENT: 'Cause my concern is just making sure that we
14 are at least paying the minimum wage.

15 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Right.

16 MR. WARNE: Right. I've done that (inaudible)

17 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

18 MR. WARNE: We're not.

19 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

20 MR. URQUIDI: (Inaudible)

21 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, I just want to, for a point of
22 clarification, on this page that I have for the different average in
23 median incomes, are we talking about Bullet Point 2 or Bullet Point 5
24 in terms of the Council? And that's under Tab E for those who are
25 looking in their binder. Yes.

1 MS. DENT: I personally feel it important to reflect the
2 prosperity of the region because it's at the reference point that
3 voters are gonna be looking at it from. It seems like, too, is the
4 national average, whereas, five is the Tucson, I'm gonna say average.
5 So, I, I would lean towards the, the Item 5.

6 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay. Is number two, I think, though,
7 the source say the Tucson MSA (inaudible)

8 MS. DENT: True.

9 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: 'Cause the average in median would be
10 two different numbers.

11 MR. WARNE: Not, not that it means it's right, Laura. This
12 is where I came up with my number.

13 MS. DENT: Okay. Actually, that totally - that's better.
14 Okay. Great. Then it sounds like two would be - I'm not sure. I
15 would feel great about two. Okay. Yeah.

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: And then I'm assuming we would want
17 some sort of increase from that 56 for the Mayor's position, 'cause
18 it's a little bit different set of responsibilities.

19 MR. WARNE: Right.

20 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Are we thinking we just want to pick a
21 number? 'Cause we can't exceed - we don't - we, we - kind of seems
22 like we've - we're content to just kind of establish that Phoenix is
23 our ceiling. And Phoenix, the Phoenix Mayor makes eighty-seven nine.

1 MR. WARNE: Yeah. I think it depends on what number we all
2 decide on for the Council. That's just my opinion. I don't know how
3 everybody else feels. And then, then we, then we -

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

5 MR. WARNE: - figure out what, what the Mayor's salary
6 should be. I - just anecdotally, I've had some - and some of them
7 don't live in the city, but I've told some folks in real estate and so
8 on, Republicans, couple of developers and all, and some other people
9 that I was on this Commission. And I was trying to get just a feel
10 of, you know, bounce back if you will and not say anything.

11 And I couldn't believe the salaries that some of these
12 people threw out in, in a positive way. Like one person said,
13 "There's no Council Person that should make less than a hundred
14 thousand dollars a year, and the Mayor should make a hundred and
15 thirty-five." I mean he was like blunt, quick, you know.

16 And I had some other people that, you know, aren't
17 Republicans, of course, a lot of my friends. And so far, I haven't
18 had any samples of anyone saying that this shouldn't happen.

19 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Regardless of their personal feelings
20 about the Mayor and Council?

21 MR. WARNE: Yeah. Anything. Right. It was no - there was
22 no - yeah. There was no opinion about the Mayor and Council at all.
23 It was just about the Mayor and Council's salary.

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

25 MR. WARNE: Thought I'd just throw that out.

1 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, maybe we can try to land like,
2 like, are we comfortable with 56,000 (inaudible) Do we want
3 (inaudible) Okay. And then with, with this - with a cola or
4 inflation formula, which I'm assuming we might need some help with
5 the language on that.

6 MS. DENT: I wonder if we keep it tied to the average if
7 that kind of eliminates the need for -

8 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

9 MS. DENT: - us to reference the formula as well, which
10 might be a little cleaner in voter size.

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. I kind of - I like that because
12 from representing the Tucson Metro Chamber in part of this, you know,
13 there's - it's kind of like incentive-based salary like, you know,
14 let's, let's increase the prosperity for all our citizens in Tucson,
15 and that, in turn, helps me.

16 So, I think that could be a, a, an interesting - I like
17 that a lot. Then maybe we could tie the Mayor's to like 1.2 times the
18 average, or something like that.

19 MR. WARNE: Right.

20 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, it's a little bit more than the
21 average, but -

22 MR. WARNE: Yeah. I like that, Laura, too. A, a lot. And
23 then - and, you know, I was thinking the typical, when you do cola and
24 these things, you say, "Oh, three per-," you tie it to inflation and
25 then you say not to exceed a number, you know, in case you have hyper,

1 you know. But I think - yeah. I really like Laura's suggestion
2 personally.

3 MR. URQUIDI: So, last year (inaudible)

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: I think that speaks, though, to
5 Laura's point about working with community leaders and others to
6 really refine our argument as to why this is a good idea, and
7 hopefully convey that to voters as well.

8 MR. URQUIDI: Yeah. Provide that.

9 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

10 MR URQUIDI: (Inaudible)

11 MR. WARNE: Let me ask something. Is the justification
12 that we use to arrive at, at figures, is that a matter of public
13 record to the voters as well?

14 MR. ACEDO: Yeah. Your final recommendation and report
15 will be printed on the publicity pamphlet which will be distributed
16 to voters.

17 MR. WARNE: So, the fact that we're using our justification
18 is the average income for Tucson, and that would be, that's what would
19 be noted to the voters?

20 MR. ACEDO: Correct. If that's how you word it in your
21 recommendation, yes.

22 MR. WARNE: And I have a question on - and I can't - I
23 agree with Agustin completely, and some of his comments, but it's
24 going to be on how we get this across. I guess what - and I mentioned
25 that the other day at the last meeting.

1 So, the campaign is gonna be how we do it, you know. And
2 how, how, how does this campaign happen, you know? I wasn't - I co-
3 chaired the police, fire and roads the first time, and the parks. And
4 then last time it was - I was Treasurer for the half-cent sales tax
5 continuation and neighborhood streets.

6 And, you know, we - I learned a lot, you know, about
7 selling way back (inaudible) than other campaigns. But to me, it's
8 gonna be how we organize ourselves in the campaign, or how the City
9 does, or however we go about this.

10 I'm, I'm really naive. I just don't know the structure I
11 guess is what I'm asking, and how we go forward and, and sell this.

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

13 MR. WARNE: Or we'll be right back to, I think, what
14 Agustin's comments were.

15 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: And I think that all happens outside
16 of these meetings. We create a recommendation, move that forward to
17 Council. And then at that point, we recruit, you know, people to help
18 either put together a pack or however, you know, like you want to do
19 that structure that way.

20 And I know there were some materials and maybe we could
21 have someone from the attorney's office come and explain to us in
22 person how, like how limit - there's some, I think, my understanding
23 is limits is what we can do as representatives of this Commission.

24 MR. WARNE: Right.

25 MS. DENT: Uh-huh.

1 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: You know, electioneering. You have to
2 be careful about that type of stuff. So, I think definitely outside
3 of these meetings, a few of us, you know, not to break Open Meeting
4 Law, but we'll meet to kind of - if we want to help be part of that
5 campaign, think about what that looks like.

6 MR. WARNE: That's a different group that then gets formed
7 and goes forward.

8 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. If they want to, and if they
9 want to raise money and that type of stuff, they need to organize a
10 collection committee and those types of (inaudible)

11 MR. WARNE: Which is not part of our purview at all.

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yup.

13 MR. WARNE: Okay. Thanks.

14 MS. DENT: I think the good news is that this body will
15 essentially (inaudible) and give us, I think, more flexibility -

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

17 MS. DENT: - to carry on conversations for those that want
18 to be part of them or not.

19 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

20 MS. DENT: I have a logistical question. So, once we form
21 a recommendation which I know we need to do by March 15th, how quickly
22 then does that go to Mayor and Council for their review and approval?

23 MR. FIGUEROA: So, it would go to Mayor and Council mainly
24 for them to take action of establishing a special election to be put
25 this issue on the general election ballot.

1 MS. DENT: Okay.

2 MR. FIGUEROA: But it goes more so as a formality. So,
3 it's not for their review or their approval, if you guys approve to
4 give Mayor and Council salary increases.

5 The issue goes directly to the ballot, and that's why as
6 when they decide to call the special election, it usually happens a
7 couple of meetings after March 15th, which is -

8 MS. DENT: Okay.

9 MR. FIGUEROA: - the date of the final recommendations.

10 MS. DENT: Okay.

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, I was just doing some
12 calculations, but - so, if we, for this year's example, for 2021, the
13 average, you know, wage for forty - 56,000. So, if you - I was
14 thinking for the Mayor's position, if we wanted to do like 1.25 times
15 the average wage, that was kind of the formula for that position.

16 If we wanted to move forward in that formula direction
17 where we using the average wage as a salary for Council, and then I
18 think we all kind of agree that the Mayor's needs to be a little bit
19 more. And so, one suggestion I have is maybe one, you know, one and a
20 quarter times the average.

21 MR. WARNE: Well, it's so low, this is really not a good
22 number, but I did sort of the same thing. And today, the Mayor makes
23 43% more.

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

1 MR. WARNE: And, but, but it's on such a low base of
2 24,000, so, it's really, you know, not totally appropriate math-wise.

3 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. 'Cause I think 1.25 times 56 is
4 70,000.

5 MR. WARNE: Yeah.

6 MR. URQUIDI: You know, I, I agree (inaudible) That's
7 going to be, that's, that's, that's - that recommendation is, is
8 justified. However, if you look, going back to my point, if you look
9 at the, the tendency - I'm putting myself in the place of a voter, -

10 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

11 MR. URQUIDI: - of the average voter. The tendency is to
12 look at a really big increase, and say, "Okay. What are they making
13 now," and the really big increase. And then their - the tendency of
14 the average voter is, is to reject it.

15 So, if our job is just to - is, is to put the best
16 recommendation forward, and then just: Okay. Leave it up to the
17 voters without any consideration, then it's gonna be rejected.

18 But I'm afraid if you, if your, if the increase is gonna
19 be too high, which, which may be justified with all the factors
20 considered, the average voter is just going to automatically reject
21 it. So, that just has to, you know, be taken under consideration.

22 MS. DENT: I think that's where the messaging is gonna be
23 very important when we do our recommendation.

24 MR. URQUIDI: You're right.

1 MS. DENT: As your, as your average voter, they don't
2 really know how much our Mayor and Council are paid.

3 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

4 MS. DENT: They just don't. They - I think they assume
5 that they're making above average wage.

6 MR. URQUIDI: Oh, they - well, they know what they're -
7 let, let me just ask this. In the, in the voter material, it's going
8 to say what their, their current salary is, right?

9 MR. ACEDO: Correct. So, the ballot language would include
10 their current salary and the proposed salary.

11 MR. URQUIDI: Most voters already know what they're making
12 now.

13 MS. DENT: Correct. However, it does state here before
14 that we only are moving up from 42 - now this year to 56?

15 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

16 MS. DENT: And this, this particular measure was just
17 barely defeated. Just barely.

18 MR. WARNE: Right.

19 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Forty-two. Well, that was the Mayor.

20 MS. DENT: Yes. I'm talking about (inaudible)

21 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

22 MS. DENT: Twenty-four to thirty-six. What were we
23 proposing for? Fifty-six.

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

25 MS. DENT: That one will be a little bit difficult, yeah.

1 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: In the -

2 MS. DENT: To, to bring up for Council.

3 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: In the voter pamphlets, though,
4 there's the opportunity for people to write letters of support, right?
5 And those to be published?

6 MR. ACEDO: Correct.

7 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

8 MS. DENT: Yeah. I will just say in terms of last year,
9 because there was this ongoing litigation around City of Tucson
10 election cycle, -

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

12 MS. DENT: - this Committee didn't convene until like the
13 summer. And so, there was very little time for community education
14 conversations or any of that work. So, there was some good
15 participation in the publicity pamphlet.

16 But I definitely think there could have been more robust
17 education efforts working with business groups and community
18 organizations to say, "This is the, the baseline that we're at, and
19 this is where we're hoping to be should voters approve this."

20 So, I, I will just say that it was very narrowly defeated,
21 and there was really not a lot of space for that education effort.

22 So, -

23 MR. ACEDO: Uh-huh.

24 MS. DENT: - not that this is stuff that this group is
25 gonna be doing. But if we have more time, or if there is more time,

1 there's more space for the public dialogue, even though these are very
2 low participation -

3 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

4 MS. DENT: - items unfortunately. But they could be very
5 important for us to be very succinct in our rationale. So, then, that
6 way the, the people who are gonna move forward with educating the
7 public have solid reasons why we're suggesting this.

8 Because as I'm reading last, the last time this was done,
9 honestly, I think the average voter having seen that our City Council
10 Members are making under minimum wage, I, I think that would have been
11 a lot easier sell than the education process, or will be when, when
12 they see that.

13 MR. WARNE: I, I agree. And, you know, I know (inaudible)
14 the meeting laws, but I can't agree with you more about the messaging
15 and what's formed after our recommendation. And personally, I think
16 our recommendation, whatever we decide, should be - our justification
17 should be very simple.

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

19 MS. DENT: Uh-huh.

20 MR. WARNE: Just a couple points.

21 MS. DENT: Agreed.

22 MR. WARNE: You know, real simple, you know, like the 401,
23 or 411. Real simple, you know? All neighborhood streets, not the
24 other streets. Just your street, and you know, that's -

25 MS. DENT: Uh-huh.

1 MR. WARNE: - 74% of the vote, right? I think that's what
2 we, you know, couldn't agree -

3 MS. DENT: Uh-huh.

4 MR. WARNE: - more with your statement, yeah. And - is
5 those key points. Hopefully, (inaudible) relative to Agustin's
6 comment which I definitely agree with him. You know, make the score
7 rise that if it's just a relative. Here's, here's what they make
8 today, and here's they're gonna make tomorrow, that will cause a
9 problem. We have to justify why -

10 MR. DENT: Uh-huh.

11 MR. WARNE: - the numbers in a very simple way.

12 MR. URQUIDI: Correct, yeah. Agree.

13 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: I see where you're coming from,
14 though. Like there is, I think, it's not definitely a legitimate
15 argument to be made that like do we just do some kind of some small
16 incremental increases?

17 But also feel like we have a responsibility to make a
18 recommendation that we feel, though, is - accurately reflects the work
19 that our Mayor and Council do, even if it's not maybe what's gonna be
20 popular. But, you know, I think there's - I think you could really
21 argue it either way. I think you could, I think you could.

22 MR. URQUIDI: I, I think that's a very good point. And I
23 was sort of asking an open question.

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

1 MR. URQUIDI: It is our job to make the (inaudible) the
2 best recommendation based on objective, you know.

3 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

4 MR. URQUIDI: (Inaudible)

5 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay. So, for the next meeting, can
6 you help us put together some language for what this would look like
7 if we're doing a formula-based recommendation where it's the average
8 wage according to the U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis. And then what
9 are we feeling like for the Mayor? Like one, like how, how much more
10 (inaudible) beyond do we want that calculation to be?

11 MR. URQUIDI: What did you say previously?

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Two five - 1.25.

13 MR. URQUIDI: 1.25? (Inaudible)

14 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh. Above the average. For '21,
15 2021 it was 56,000. So, in this scenario, the Mayor would then make
16 70,000. We could do more, we could do less.

17 MS. DENT: I mean, instinctively I feel like that's a good
18 ratio, and it's a good living wage that also reflects the additional
19 responsibility that the Mayor carries over the Council.

20 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

21 MS. DENT: I noticed the, like ratio in Phoenix is like
22 1.4, and that gets the Mayor to 80. But I come back to your point
23 about the viability piece.

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

1 MS. DENT: So, I personally feel really great about the
2 average wage and making that the clear kind of message. I feel like
3 maybe some time to think about this piece. But I tend to agree with
4 the 1.25.

5 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

6 MS. DENT: I feel like that's a good, round number as well,
7 because, you know, people are gonna be like, "Well, what does that
8 mean?"

9 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

10 MS. DENT: In my every day (inaudible)

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

12 MS. DENT: - we'll have to be able to articulate that
13 smaller amount, too.

14 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. (Inaudible)

15 MS. DENT: So, I tend to, to feel pretty good about that.

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay. Any other thoughts? So, for
17 moving forward, if we feel like we're kind of comfortable where we are
18 with moving forward with this formula of the average wage, do we want
19 to start kind of maybe working on our justification, and some things
20 that we definitely want to make sure are included in the
21 recommendation? Okay.

22 I think in our notebooks, the last two, there's the last
23 two years. There's 2021 and 2022 which is under Tab 3 and Tab 4. You
24 know, Tom, you were talking about how you kind of did some research on

1 the budget. I think there's a great bullet point in here about how
2 much the City's budget has increased since the last increase. And -

3 MR. WARNE: Right.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: And two years ago, it had increased
5 almost 50%. So, we're probably over that 50% mark right now. So, -

6 MR. WARNE: Right.

7 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: - I think that's an interesting - we
8 can -

9 MR. WARNE: Or, or the budget when this - their \$24,000
10 salary was passed. And so, we could show that budget, and then show
11 the budget that now the Council-Mayor are responsible for. Only just
12 two - my head. It's two million sixty-three thousand, something like
13 that. So, almost two million one. So, -

14 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

15 MR. WARNE: - that, you know, we show that ratio of how
16 long ago, and Agustin brought up the date, so, what the date was when
17 that was approved. What the budget was when that was approved and now
18 where the City of Tucson is today. (Inaudible)

19 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: (Inaudible) So, it would have been
20 fiscal year 2000. Can you get the budget, total budget numbers for
21 fiscal year 2000?

22 MR. ACEDO: Yes, absolutely.

23 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: And I think we have the budget here -

24 MR. WARNE: Yeah.

25 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: - for this year (inaudible)

1 MR. WARNE: It's, it's - yeah, it's about two million
2 sixty-three thousand, or something, budget that was passed last June.
3 And also, I think that - now, you want to keep it simple, but I think
4 that we could use the budget of - we could use it not to - gotta be
5 careful here.

6 Not, not to pit the Supervisors against Mayor and Council.
7 But, you know, Mr. Ortega is doing such a good job with the, with the
8 combined effort now with the County.

9 Why don't - we could use (inaudible) the budget of the
10 County and show what the Supervisors make, which I think is
11 legitimate. Like to see our Council make that. But show that, and
12 then show what the budget of the City is. And then also equate it to
13 the salaries. And -

14 MR. URQUIDI: Yeah. We, we can do that. Also, I saw
15 something for Albuquerque. And, and, you know, their Mayor makes
16 135,500. I mean we're, we're not gonna go that high, but I, I think
17 it might be valid to make comparisons between -

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

19 MR. URQUIDI: - five cities and say, you know, does the
20 Mayor and Council - sister cities, you know, so that it allows the
21 voter to, to, to see a comparison between the cities.

22 MR. WARNE: I agree, Agustin. One thing in Albuquerque, I,
23 I was thinking just like you. And then I looked in it and saw the
24 Council making 33,000 a year. And I (inaudible) is that variance, you
25 know?

1 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: (Inaudible) I wonder how they're
2 structured? 'Cause it -

3 MS. DENT: Uh-huh.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. It could, it could not be
5 (inaudible) Manager-Council, where the Mayor's acting more like a true
6 CEO, -

7 MR. URQUIDI: Uh-huh. Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: - you know? So that -

9 MR. URQUIDI: And you have the, the strong Mayor structure
10 versus the -

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

12 MR. URQUIDI: What do they call the other?

13 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Council-Manager.

14 MR. URQUIDI: Yeah. Council-Manager.

15 MS. DENT: Yeah. I also looked at Colorado, and I was
16 thinking Colorado Springs is more of our sister city in Colorado. And
17 the Mayor makes \$103,000 a year. However, the Council makes only a
18 \$6,000 a year stipend.

19 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, it must be -

20 MS. DENT: So, -

21 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: - more like that.

22 MS. DENT: - more like a CEO structure.

23 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: (Inaudible) Yeah.

1 MR. WARNE: On the side, it would be very interesting to
2 really know the local politics to know how much influence the Council
3 Members have at all.

4 MS. DENT: Right.

5 MR. WARNE: Over here, they have a lot of influence.

6 MS. DENT: So, just for clarity. Are we right now kind of
7 crafting the considerations and rationale component or -

8 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. We're just kind of
9 brainstorming what, what we want to make sure is captured in that.

10 MS. DENT: Uh-huh. Got it. Okay.

11 MS. GARCIA: I mean I like the kind of like snippets that
12 can be really like easily rattled off, like the -

13 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

14 MR. URQUIDI: A bullet points, yeah.

15 MS. GARCIA: Yeah. I like the fact that, you know, they
16 make less than minimum wage and it cost - this would cost, you know,
17 citizens 15 cents a year, those sort of things like, like (inaudible)

18 MR. WARNE: Or asking for our Council to make the average
19 wage in Tucson.

20 MS. GARCIA: Yes. I, I think that's honestly the number
21 one bullet. Highlight, underlined, like that messages is, is really
22 clear. I did want to just name - I, I do feel it's important for us
23 to reiterate the full-time component.

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

1 MS. GARCIA: Because I feel that there's (inaudible)
2 narrative in the community that these are part-time positions. And
3 there's nothing, you know, in the Charter, or what we've like reviewed
4 historically, based on the conversations we had two years ago, that
5 represents that. I think it's a good effort for us to like just keep
6 pushing.

7 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

8 MS. GARCIA: Like this is a full-time job.

9 MS. DENT: Right.

10 MS. GARCIA: And I had noticed that. The very first bullet
11 point was Tucson Mayor and Council serve in a full-time capacity. I
12 feel it would have hit a little bit harder if it said "current salary
13 structure", or no, sorry. Not that one.

14 That the, that they are not making minimum wage. I think
15 if, if that word would have followed instead of the "not received a
16 salary increase", I think if it would have just said they are not even
17 making minimum wage, -

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

19 MS. GARCIA: - would have hit harder for that one.

20 MR. WARNE: Yeah. Now where - go ahead.

21 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Well, I was just gonna say, I think
22 that narrative works - it almost is like this, like negative loop
23 where the Council Members don't make enough. So, several of them have
24 other jobs which then makes it seem like it's part-time, 'cause

1 they're also doing other jobs. But really they're just trying to make
2 enough money to live.

3 MS. DENT: Uh-huh.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, it's like this narrative that's
5 just working against itself because of the situation. So, yeah,
6 that's definitely gonna be something we need to stress.

7 And I'm, I'm hoping we can get some data from their offices
8 so that we can say the average Council Member in the City of Tucson is
9 working 60 hours a week or whatever numbers they provide us. I think
10 that would be insightful.

11 MS. DENT: The other supporting rationale that I think we
12 should also stress is about the current salary structures preventing
13 working-class Tucsonans from seeking these positions. As a longtime
14 Tucson resident, I feel like we have these career Council Members.

15 And I, I don't think that's different from a lot of us that
16 have been here for a very long time because you see these faces on
17 Council, and you're like, "Oh, they've been there forever."

18 And I want to see fresh blood. And I want these salaries
19 to be comparable to other cities because we don't want to lose our
20 good talent, or our good citizens that feel like they don't have a
21 voice here.

22 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

23 MR. URQUIDI: Yeah. (Inaudible)

24 MS. DENT: Right.

25 MR. URQUIDI: Salary.

1 MS. DENT: Yeah.

2 MR. URQUIDI: Yeah.

3 MS. DENT: Right. Yeah.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: I think a good way to frame that, too,
5 is like what this increase will do for the citizens, not what it will
6 do for the Mayor and Council.

7 MS. DENT: Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: It will provide you the opportunity to
9 actually consider running for public office.

10 MS. DENT: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: It will provide you with a better pool
12 of candidates. It will talk about just things it will do for the
13 voter, -

14 MS. DENT: Uh-huh.

15 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: - not so much like, "This person
16 should get a raise, so, why don't you give them a raise?"

17 MR. URQUIDI: I, I think that's (inaudible)

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Right.

19 MR. URQUIDI: (Inaudible)

20 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

21 MR. URQUIDI: - more than a full-time job.

22 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh. Yeah. Well, just speaking of
23 somebody who's just graduated out of the program at the U of A, a lot
24 of my cohorts are hightailing it out of Tucson. They, they feel it's
25 not viable for them to, to serve in Tucson. And so, they go up to

1 Phoenix. They, they move to Albuquerque. I've seen some go out to
2 the federal level.

3 MS. DENT: Uh-huh.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: And it would be nice to be able to keep
5 that talent and that knowledge pool here in Tucson.

6 MR. WARNE: Yup. One of my good friends, former
7 Supervisor, used to say was - a very good degree from the University
8 of Arizona. He used to say, "What we do is we export education. We
9 educate and then export."

10 MS. DENT: That's correct.

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, Jesus, in years past, who develops
12 this recommendation? Like is this something that maybe that you guys
13 put together, or was it something that like I, as the Chair, should
14 kind of start drafting and, and like how does that work?

15 MR. ACEDO: It's varied in the past. Recently what
16 typically takes place is you guys establish a recommendation which I
17 think you guys reach like a good number right now.

18 And then we start drafting the recommendation based on your
19 considerations and stuff like that. And we bring it forward for the
20 next meeting for you guys to consider and kind of work through it at
21 that point.

22 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

23 MR. WARNE: Do we have the right to then advise Mayor and
24 Council (inaudible) Staff? Then this is what we want to say?

25 MR. ACEDO: Yeah. Absolutely. Yeah.

1 MR. WARNE: And I agree with Laura that, you know, yeah, I
2 always call it, people call it the "elevator speech", or whatever.

3 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

4 MR. WARNE: But I think that, you know, when you're trying
5 it - I don't know, my - on those bond issues and so on I co-chaired, I
6 think that simple is better, and direct, and maybe no more than just
7 five strong bullet points, boom.

8 And, you know, and then we go from there, you know, after
9 we're dissolved. And then, whoever picks it up can run it, but
10 instead of like a lot of prose, a lot of writing -

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

12 MR. WARNE: - you know? Just really strong bullet points,
13 like, you know.

14 MS. DENT: I agree with you, Tom. And I would love to
15 actually see what the language the voter is gonna see because this
16 memo is gonna be sent to Council. A small fraction of folks like
17 ourselves -

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

19 MS. DENT: - are maybe gonna see it, but the voters will
20 not see it. So, the language that the voters are gonna consider is
21 like the actual language on the ballot. And I would love if we can
22 see what looked like in 2021, and be able to even frame it like, for
23 example, all these recommendations are put in monthly terms.

24 I don't think any of us think about what we make a month.
25 I think we think about what we make an hour, or what our annual salary

1 is. So, I would love if we can take a look at that and make
2 recommendations in that vein.

3 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay. So, -

4 MR. URQUIDI: (Inaudible)

5 MR. WARNE: And maybe the, you know, the justification for
6 Mayor and Council has to be a little longer prose, but also, I'm
7 asking, I don't know, can we - 'cause the other things were just so
8 different than this as far as the procedure process. But could we
9 then say we would like to see these five bullet points on the ballot?

10 MR. ACEDO: So, the ballot language is drafted by the City
11 Attorney, and there are some restrictions from, that they're right
12 from the Charter on what can and can't be included. But we can
13 definitely invite one of the attorneys to be present at one of our
14 future meetings and they can speak more about this if you guys are
15 interested.

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yes, we (inaudible)

17 MR. WARNE: Great idea.

18 MR. ACEDO: Absolutely.

19 MR. WARNE: Like that, Alexa?

20 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Can, can we get the ballot language
21 for the last two years?

22 MR. ACEDO: Yes. Absolutely. We'll, we'll provide that
23 via e-mail so you can have it more readily -

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Perfect.

25 MR. ACEDO: - before the next meeting.

1 MR. WARNE: I'm asking Alexa. Then you'd like to invite
2 the City Attorney once we kind of get our, our draft to come in and so
3 -

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah.

5 MR. WARNE: - great. That's great.

6 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: And then I think we can also ask
7 questions then like outside of this Commission what can and can't we
8 do in terms of helping the campaign for this. So, I think that would
9 be good 'cause I know there's some material in here but legal memos
10 are not easily readable -

11 MR. WARNE: Right.

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: - for the layman.

13 MR. WARNE: And we're not allowed to say certain things, to
14 talk to certain people.

15 MR. URQUIDI: Yeah. That's a good idea because I have a
16 tendency to think, and I may be totally wrong, that we not allowed to
17 campaign.

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

19 MR. URQUIDI: That our job is to simply put forth a
20 recommendation and then, and then say, "Okay. Let the voters
21 decide -,"

22 MR. WARNE: Yeah.

23 MR. URQUIDI: "- if the justifications for our
24 recommendation -", so, I'm gonna let the voter. As, as far as
25 campaigning, think we have to be careful, but that's -

1 MS. DENT: Is there -

2 MR. URQUIDI: - my opinion.

3 MS. DENT: Is there any limitation to how we can, or if we
4 can be available at some of these communica- -- community education
5 events? Can we be there?

6 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. There was -

7 MR. WARNE: You mean after we're, after we're dissolved?
8 We're dissolved, right? Yes. So, we have to ask the City Attorney,
9 since we're on this Committee, can we then - once we're not on this
10 Committee, 'cause there is no Committee, can we then campaign?

11 MR. ACEDO: And you can. So, after the Committee
12 dissolves, you can campaign as a former member of the Committee and
13 everything. It just can't be as a Commission as a whole. But once
14 the Committee dissolves, yes.

15 MS. DENT: We're writing the letters of support for this?
16 We can do that?

17 MR. ACEDO: Yes.

18 MS. DENT: Okay.

19 MR. ACEDO: Absolutely.

20 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: So, at our next meeting, will we have
21 like some language in a document like this to review or -

22 MR. ACEDO: Yeah. So, based on the preliminary,
23 preliminary recommendation, we can start drafting the -

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

1 MR. ACEDO: - final recommendation, and we wrote down some
2 of the justifications and suggestions you guys were giving us, so -

3 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

4 MR. ACEDO: - when drafted, we can even display it on the
5 screen and we could kind of work through it together if that sounds
6 good.

7 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. That sounds great.

8 MR. ACEDO: Okay.

9 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: And then we'll get the more
10 information about budget from the year that this was passed, or the
11 last increase was passed. Anything, any other data that you feel like
12 you guys need to help inform your decisions?

13 MR. WARNE: No. It's - and it's legal - I think you asked
14 for it, Alexa, it's legal to get what was said on the ballot, what was
15 said on the campaign pieces.

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yes.

17 MR. WARNE: Is that - that's legal? We can just
18 (inaudible) 'cause that was public? Right. Okay.

19 MR. ACEDO: And just for a point of clarification, the
20 invite for the City Attorneys to come, would you like that done after
21 the recommendation is more finalized or did you want them for the next
22 meeting?

23 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yeah. I think we need a few more
24 meetings to fine tune. But I do think we might need help on the
25 language for how we're framing, 'cause we're not giving you a hard

1 number as our, our recommendation. It's gonna - like how, how that
2 should be worded.

3 MR. ACEDO: Okay.

4 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: (Inaudible)

5 MR. ACEDO: And, and we can reach out now and, and -

6 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Yes.

7 MR. ACEDO: - say, you know, "This is what the Commission
8 is envisioning. What are your thoughts and recommendations," and -

9 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: That'd be great.

10 MR. ACEDO: - kind of go from there. Okay. We'll do that.

11 MS. GARCIA: Could we, could we lean into - I like the idea
12 of a round number.

13 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

14 MS. GARCIA: Could we lean into like the 56,000 as the
15 closely, most closely correlated average, and then - yeah, kind of
16 make that the forward facing recommendation. I kind of, of like the
17 philosophy of like, let's make our recommendation to the attorneys,
18 and then see what they think. At least we get like a lot of different
19 ideas and opinions. But I love the idea of the like alignment with
20 the average and think that if we -

21 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Uh-huh.

22 MS. GARCIA: - can lean into the round number, I kind of
23 think that that's a little more accessible for people.

24 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay.

1 MS. GARCIA: But I don't think it's a huge idea. A huge
2 important, but -

3 MR. WARNE: An easier sell and not complicated. Boom.
4 Boom. Right. The average (inaudible) 56,000. Right.

5 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Okay. I think we made some good
6 progress tonight.

7 MS. DENT: Yeah.

8 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: And next, next week we'll have
9 something kind of tangible to start looking through, and in the
10 meantime if you do need anything, you know, make sure to reach out to
11 Jesus and Rene. And hopefully Nico and Greg - we did all the work,
12 'cause we didn't - what the heck? They missed it all.

13 MS. GARCIA: (Inaudible) I feel like this was so
14 productive and this - and, yeah.

15 CHAIRPERSON SCHOLL: Great. Okay. Well, I think we will
16 adjourn at 6:21.

17 MR. WARNE: Thank you. Thanks, Staff. Thank you guys.

18 MR. ACEDO: Absolutely.

19 (Meeting was Adjourned.)

I hereby certify that, to the best of my ability the foregoing is a true and accurate transcription of the original tape-recorded conversation in the case reference on page 1 above.

Transcription Completed: 02/23/2023

Kathleen R. Krassow
KATHLEEN R. KRASSOW - Owner
M&M Typing Service