

City of Tucson Redistricting Advisory Committee  
Electronically Recorded Meeting 10/19/2020

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Jonathan Rothschild, Chairman  
Charlene Mendoza, Vice-Chair

Michael O'Connell	(Ward 1)	
Marion Chubon	(Ward 2)	
Glenn Perkins	(Ward 3)	(Arrived at 5:15 P.M.)
Kelly Anne Canady	(Ward 4)	
D. Grady Scott	(Ward 5)	(Arrived at 5:09 P.M.)
Jonathan Rothschild	(Ward 6)	
Charlene Mendoza	(Mayor)	

ABSENT:

None

STAFF PRESENT:

Roger W. Randolph, City Clerk  
Suzanne Mesich, Chief Deputy City Clerk  
Maria Talamante, Assistant City Clerk  
Yolanda Lozano, Assistant City Clerk  
Shawna Lee, City Records Manager  
Randy Hammel, Systems Analyst, City Clerk's Office  
Ana Marrufo, Management Assistant, City Clerk's Office  
Dennis P. McLaughlin, Principal Assistant City Attorney  
Jennifer Stash, Principal Assistant City Attorney

=====

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: - proposal. The only changes I had,  
2 or one, I, I think in - on page two, paragraph two - we're not  
3 supposed to talk about Staff or any of the, of the members  
4 particularly.

5 So, I just took out - I just made it Option A and Option B.  
6 And then in the second paragraph, because of the way first paragraph  
7 reads now, we can just say there's two options, and they'll just send  
8 both options to Mayor and Council.

9 Then, on the box, I added, under Option A, showing as a  
10 plus, the fact it's impro- -- in- -- increasing the Hispanic  
11 population in Ward 3. And I just added that it affects, where it

1 says, "Disrupts more residents," I added, "Affects voters in four  
2 wards," instead of two.

3 And then, I, I also took out about the redistribution of  
4 population, and thought, and quite frankly on all of that, it might be  
5 best just to give them these boxes that just say, "Look, this, this  
6 and this."

7 I'm good with taking out - Michael, Michael didn't like the  
8 idea of putting in "simplest approach". And I'm good with that. I, I  
9 just think somewhere, we ought to have a note that there is gonna be a  
10 Census this year which is gonna require we - coming back together.

11 And again, I don't, you know, I get it that that's gonna  
12 happen anyway regardless. I just think it does go to the idea of  
13 moving 12,000 versus 4,000 or 5,000.

14 So, I don't, I don't have a problem with taking out -  
15 whomever taking notes - I guess we get one more look at this at some  
16 point, the idea of simplest approach. But I would like, and it  
17 doesn't necessarily have to be in a box, but somewhere, a notation  
18 that, you know, there's gonna be a Census in 2020.

19 And, and then I just changed the word "stack" to "pack".  
20 That's closer to what the wordage (sic), verbiage they use. And then  
21 I put in, in each case, what the - it's doing, because it is  
22 interesting that in Option A, we're increasing the Hispanic  
23 population.

24 We're increasing the total minority population, just like  
25 we're doing in, in Option B on Ward 5, you know, sort of increasing -

1 I'm not saying it's necessarily a problem, but it's just really hard  
2 the way our city's set up, you know?

3 And then, in Ward 3, we added the business about increasing  
4 the Hispanic population, but we're also increasing the minority  
5 population in a district that's already majority-minority. And so,  
6 that ought to be noted.

7 Just putting the notes, I don't know that we have to say  
8 anything in addition. Council's gonna be smart enough to look at all  
9 this. I just thought it would be helpful if they saw exactly what's  
10 happening in the wards under both options, as opposed to getting a  
11 whole lot of information like we got that we had to sift through to  
12 get there.

13 So, anyway, that's, that's my additions to what Kelly did,  
14 or deletions. Again, I don't have any problem with taking out the  
15 business about simple approach. So, I don't know if anybody else has  
16 anything to add. If not -

17 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: This is Charlene.

18 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

19 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Sorry. I'm just having trouble  
20 getting on and off mute. I did have a couple of suggestions, or  
21 recommendations. I'm just trying to call them up in an easy-to-read  
22 way.

23 And I agreed with a lot of the things that other folks - I  
24 had on my list to changing it to Option One and Two. So, thank you,  
25 for doing that, Mayor. I think that makes a lot of sense.

1 I would like to suggest that we remove the word "disrupt"  
2 and just use the word "move".

3 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. I'm good with that.

4 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I think that it's just redundant.

5 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

6 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: (Inaudible)

7 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Shawna, are you taking notes wherever  
8 you are? Shawna?

9 MR. RANDOLPH: She is, Your Honor.

10 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. Okay. Okay. Okay. We got  
11 that, Charlene. That's good.

12 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: On number - a second one is in the  
13 delta column for Option A, I just wanted to double-check, because in  
14 my mind, we're only changing, or affecting voters in three wards,  
15 because although Ward 6 is impacted, we're not actually moving anybody  
16 out. But that, to me, I just wanted to make sure we were on the same  
17 page. But to me, we're really only affecting voters in three wards.

18 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. Well, I mean - so, under  
19 Option B, then, you're only affecting voters in one ward, 'cause  
20 nobody's moved out of, you know (inaudible)

21 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Right. Yes. (Inaudible)

22 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: I, I, I don't care if you want to  
23 say, "Affects voters in three wards," instead of one. But I think it  
24 really does affect Ward 6, to be certain.

25 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Okay.

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

2 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I wanted to have a conversation about  
3 it.

4 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. I'd, I'd leave it. I think  
5 they'll be more confused if we - 'cause Kozachik will go, "What  
6 happened to Ward 6?"

7 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Okay. Then, I think we should  
8 probably add in somewhere for Option B that two wards are impacted.

9 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. Well, I guess it would be the  
10 same thing. "Moves more residents, 12,000. Affects voters in wards  
11 in four -," well, what we could do is we could say, "Moves more  
12 residents, affects voters in four wards."

13 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Uh-huh.

14 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: And then on the next column, it says,  
15 "Moves fewer people, affects two wards."

16 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Right. I think just to have parity, I  
17 think that makes good sense.

18 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay.

19 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I was - I had a similar suggestion to  
20 Michael, but that one was already addressed. I actually didn't mind  
21 if we kept "simplest approach", because it is simpler. I was just  
22 gonna suggest we strike the part about the 2020 Census because my  
23 thinking about that is that it's explained in the Charter. And that  
24 was included in the package where it says clearly that that's supposed  
25 to happen two years after a Census.

1           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. Roger, I have a question. In  
2 the - so, what'll happen is, our report will go to the Council in a  
3 memo form. Are you gonna add anything else, you know, because you,  
4 you could con- -- I mean Kelly's done a really good job of kind of  
5 walking through everything.

6           But are you gonna add, you know, "This why we're doing  
7 this. We're out of compliance. We need to get to this. We're gonna  
8 do this, this and this," and you know, "We're also gonna have a - be -  
9 we're required to do this two years from now when the Census comes  
10 out."?

11           MR. RANDOLPH: So, yes. When we send this report to Mayor  
12 and Council, we'll do it as an (inaudible) to memo to begin with so  
13 that they have your recommendation. We will provide them kind of  
14 basic information that we provided the Committee, as well as at the  
15 public hearing about why we're doing this and, and what is looked at  
16 by the Committee.

17           And then right now, we've been asked to schedule this on  
18 the November 17<sup>th</sup> Mayor and Council meeting. And there at the  
19 communication, we'll go into a little bit further detail about the  
20 Charter and the requirements and why this is brought forward now and  
21 how it will be coming back based on the Census in 2020.

22           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. So, maybe in that one box that  
23 said "simplest approach is the process we repeated following 2020  
24 Census", (inaudible) I mean we've kind of said already, "Moves fewer  
25 people, affects two wards".

1           And, and that really answers most of that. And I guess  
2 what I'm trying to get to, obviously, is when you move all these  
3 people now, not knowing what, not, not knowing what's gonna happen in  
4 two years, or knowing you're gonna have to make moves in two years.

5           And so, the, the two thoughts kind of go together. But I'm  
6 not quite sure, you know. I'd like it to be kind of in the box just  
7 'cause I think people are gonna really use this box.

8           VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Uh-huh.

9           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Kelly, you were the author of this.  
10 Any suggestions for where something about that could go?

11          VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Marion still has her hand up.

12          CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Who does?

13          VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Marion.

14          CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Oh, I see it. Marion.

15          MS. CANADY: Sorry. I was muted. Go ahead, Marion.

16          MS. CHUBON: I wasn't gonna answer that question, but I, I  
17 have a different question.

18          CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. Go ahead. (Inaudible)

19          MS. CHUBON: And so, we keep speaking about in two years  
20 with the Census is gonna change things so dramatically, and I'm just  
21 curious. Do we know that?

22                 You know, I think that there's, there, there's an  
23 assumption that the numbers that we're working on are somewhat  
24 accurate, because the num- -- the numbers have changed, obviously,  
25 since the last Census.

1           So, I just, I just want to know. Do we know that the  
2 Census questions, or numbers, are gonna be so dramatically different  
3 than what we are - the numbers that we're working off of?

4           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: I don't know. Roger, have you ever  
5 had to do this? Did you do this after the last Census?

6           MR. RANDOLPH: We did, Your Honor. And in 2012, we had  
7 some very significant changes. Part of this will also depend on when  
8 the County re-precincts. If they re-precinct in '21, which they  
9 probably won't, based on the Census being delayed. So, we won't have  
10 those numbers probably in '22 (sic).

11           But if they re-precinct before this Committee's formed  
12 again, there's a very possible chance that they will move precincts  
13 pretty dramatically like they did last time.

14           The County is attempting to consolidate precincts so that  
15 they are more capable of doing vote centers and those types of things,  
16 as the State Legislature allows them to do that.

17           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Hmm. So, yeah, I mean, I mean I  
18 think you can expect, Marion, some serious work in '22. But what it's  
19 gonna look like, you know, I, I, I don't know anybody that predict  
20 that.

21           But, I mean, you know, the other thing is, we can just  
22 leave it out. They're - these guys, Council's all smart enough to  
23 figure out 4,000, 12,000, four two. Okay, the Census thing.

24           (Inaudible) Roger, is, is you're gonna - sounds like you're  
25 gonna reference that in, in your memo, correct?



1 MR. RANDOLPH: I won't go into detail about what we think  
2 the Census is going to do, but we'll just talk about the fact that the  
3 Charter requires that the redistricting be looked at again two years  
4 following the Census.

5 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. Okay. So, I, I, I don't have  
6 a problem taking that out of the box. I think it's covered. So, we  
7 don't have "simple" or "Census".

8 MS. CHUBON: I was also wondering (inaudible) doesn't  
9 redistribute the population as evenly, equitably as Option A?

10 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. I, I mean that's - I mean when  
11 I look at it, and you know, I, I just don't think - I, I don't know  
12 what you want to put there. We definitely put, again, already in the  
13 pluses of Option A, redistributes population more evenly overall. But  
14 I'm not sure when you look at it, that it, that it does a lot of that,  
15 you know?

16 In, in Ward 1, it's "packing more". In Ward 3, there's an  
17 increase, but the increase in the total is now increasing what's  
18 already a minor- -- majority-minority district. In Ward 5, it does  
19 decrease a little. And in Ward 6, it decreases, which isn't helpful.

20 And, and by the way, you can run these numbers around.  
21 Whatever precinct you hit, you're gonna get, you know, pluses and  
22 minuses. So, that's why I was just thinking, the best thing to do is  
23 just give them the squares where they can look at and judge for  
24 themselves, you know? So, -

25 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Mr. Mayor, this is Dennis.

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Dennis. Yeah.

2 MR. McLAUGHLIN: When - as soon as the Committee Members  
3 have spoken, I have one issue I want to raise for the Committee's  
4 consideration.

5 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Well, you better give it to us,  
6 'cause you're probably having something more serious than anything  
7 we're talking about.

8 MR. McLAUGHLIN: No, no, no. Nothing. But in the, in  
9 Option A, in the boxes that talk about increasing Hispanic  
10 population, -

11 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

12 MR. McLAUGHLIN: - there's a couple of them there. And  
13 below, there are blue boxes that also say the same thing kind of as a  
14 statement of fact. The two, the two most defensible legal  
15 considerations for you on the, on the changes, whatever change they  
16 are, are gonna be MPD and then -

17 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Right.

18 MR. McLAUGHLIN: - the total population in the wards.

19 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Right.

20 MR. McLAUGHLIN: And I just want to make sure the Committee  
21 is, is okay and not concerned about the idea that if you put  
22 increasing certain ethnic populations as a plus, it may be more  
23 problematic than if you simply state them as facts which you have in  
24 the blue boxes below.

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. That, that was kind of my  
2 concern was that we really don't have to say anything about what's,  
3 what's more equitable or not equitable, 'cause I can assure you  
4 different perspectives look at that a lot differently.

5 But, if we just say, "This is what we're doing, boom, boom,  
6 boom," then the, then the, the Council can vote, guided by, you know,  
7 Dennis. So, no, I agree, you know?

8 MR. McLAUGHLIN: And, and I hasten to emphasize, Mr. Mayor,  
9 that you have it in the blue boxes as a fact, which is fine, you know.

10 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Right.

11 MR. McLAUGHLIN: And it's the -

12 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Well, what, what, what you're kind of  
13 saying is you would take out, or like I'm going to Option A. And you  
14 would take out everything under re- -- under the - you'd put the first  
15 box, the MPD's. You'd do the second box, the neighborhood  
16 association. You'd do the third box, which does not dilute voting  
17 strength, which is true as a whole.

18 And then you would delete, under Option A, the last three  
19 boxes, and then have just the facts. And then in Option - and then on  
20 the deltas, again, you would take out the last box. And then -

21 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Can I make a case for having - if we  
22 do take those out, like for instance, the Ward 3 in the deltas on  
23 Option B, Ward 3, Hispanic population is still under the Tucson  
24 overall population of 43%. (Inaudible) that would -

25 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

1 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: - in the factual (inaudible)

2 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Right. No. I would take, on Option  
3 B, I would do the same thing. I would take out the boxes, basically.  
4 In the Option B, you're gonna have the first three boxes. You'll have  
5 the fourth box.

6 In the pluses, you'll take out the "simplest approach", and  
7 then on the deltas, you'd just take them out. And then just have the,  
8 and just have the numbers.

9 MR. McLAUGHLIN. Yeah. And I, and I hasten, I hasten to  
10 add, Mr. Mayor, that I wouldn't presume to tell the Committee what to  
11 do. I'm simply telling you that that might be more legally prudent  
12 (inaudible)

13 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Well, what - I, I mean I will tell  
14 you that, you know, it's not within the - I don't think it's within  
15 what this Committee was asked to do. This Committee was asked to, you  
16 know, bring the MPD into, into, into accord. And Option A and Option  
17 B both do that really well. And they're within, you know, .3% of each  
18 other, okay?

19 When you're doing that, you don't want to dilute the voting  
20 strength of the minority populations, and both Option A and Option B  
21 have done that. And then, after that, it really is factual, you know?  
22 One moves this many, and one moves this many. And then just give them  
23 the facts, you know?

24 But, but I will tell you, I mean, Dennis, you probably have  
25 looked at the same concern. The, the way the city's structured and

1 the way we've historically done this, you've got two wards that are,  
2 you know, way over -

3 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Uh-huh.

4 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: - what the population is. Now, now  
5 that's been done on purpose because we're trying to provide for wards  
6 that have, you know, those (inaudible) those Hispanic populations.

7 In Ward 3, you've already got a majority-minority ward.  
8 And, yeah, you could get concerned in the long run if somebody comes  
9 forward. You know, my example is, I'll take Ward 1 in a citywide  
10 election, a Republican, white female who is very strong citywide, wins  
11 that election against a Hispanic. And then you can appreciate the  
12 challenges you're gonna get.

13 But that's not, you know, that's, that would require - I'm  
14 not even sure how you would solve that problem, you know? And so,  
15 yeah, no, I tend to agree with you. It's just thrown out all the  
16 comment about what we're doing in that regard and just put the facts.  
17 And, and then, and then Council can deal with it.

18 And I, I don't think they're, you know, they're not gonna  
19 go wrong on this one. We, we've given two good options and they can  
20 see the pluses and minuses. And that's it.

21 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Well, thank you for letting me pose that.  
22 And I will put it up to the Committee's pleasure.

23 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: All right. Well, so, -

1           VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA:  Would it, would it make sense to just  
2 take it out of the language of positive and negative, and just leave  
3 it in as elements of the two options?

4           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD:  Yeah.  We could do that, I mean, but  
5 we do that with the boxes.  And if we, if we, if we bring up - and the  
6 only thing I saw about the boxes that we probably ought to change,  
7 Charlene, is the way mine, you know - the way it reads is I go down  
8 one, three, five, six, we probably out to, where we're addressing  
9 Ward 5, we probably ought to have both boxes together.  And when we're  
10 addressing Ward 6, we probably ought to have both boxes together just  
11 so people can see that.

12           So, basically, the two boxes that are on top in the second  
13 column would move down.  And you'd just have two blanks and let the  
14 Wards 1 and 3 do that.  Yeah.  And, and, and so, Marion, I think that  
15 does that, I think, you know - because for instance, in the, the Ward  
16 3 issue, we've said in the box, "Increases Hispanic population Ward 3  
17 from 41.21 to 43.16.  Increases total minority population from 55.20  
18 to 57.38."

19           So, you know - and, and I think that is helpful.  I think  
20 we're forgetting that we looked at, you know, all sorts of stuff, but  
21 we're asking them to only look at these two, and here's what's  
22 important in those two.

23           VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA:  Yeah.  I would hate to lose any of it  
24 because it did help inform also our choices -

25           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD:  Yeah.

1           VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: - to some degree. So, you know, this  
2 is not - this, this is, I don't know legally, obviously, this memo  
3 that we're gonna be sharing with them, with the City handful what the  
4 parameters are of that, but it looks like we're, you know, we're doing  
5 a little bit of catching them up to what, what process we went  
6 through, what were some of the things that we looked at.

7           Obviously, both options are going to fit the legally-  
8 mandated parameters that we set out to do. But I would hate to lose  
9 any of the, any of the process (inaudible) looking at these options.

10          CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. So, - and, and so, I think, I  
11 mean you almost have to see it aesthetically. What is (inaudible) I'm  
12 not sure what I'm looking at now. So, let's (inaudible) the screen,  
13 the red boxes represent - I'm not sure why the blue boxes got  
14 cancelled out.

15          MR. McLAUGHLIN: Maybe a different person doing the  
16 editing, Mr. Mayor. I don't know.

17          CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. I mean there's no reason for  
18 those blue boxes to have been cancelled out.

19          MR. RANDOLPH: They, they were moved down to match up the  
20 red with (inaudible)

21          CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Oh, I see what you (inaudible)

22          MR. RANDOLPH: I'm sorry.

23          CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Oh, perfect. Okay. Okay. So,  
24 let's, so, let's say we leave those boxes as is, and let's say we just

1 say, "No Tucson population is Hispanic population is (sic)." Then the  
2 comments obviously go out.

3 Now, let's go back up, whoever controlling that. Okay.  
4 So, just start box one stays, box - or box two stays, box three stays.  
5 So, basically, what Dennis has said is we may not want to, on the  
6 pluses on Option A, have box four, five or six because it's kind of  
7 commenting on what's already factually noted before, okay?

8 And then you would leave the edits we've made, "Moves more  
9 residents, affecting voters in four wards instead of two". So, those  
10 boxes would go out. Can you, can you -

11 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: We're interested in hearing from Kelly  
12 why you put those - why your initial thinking was to put that  
13 information in, what you think about what we're considering right now.

14 MS. CANADY: Yeah. I, you know, this - my table was really  
15 based on the conversation we had as a Committee. I wasn't, as a  
16 Committee wasn't, you know, thinking in terms of legal, but like what  
17 the Committee likes, and also highlighted as, you know, problems or  
18 deltas with both proposals (inaudible) And, you know, just - it was  
19 based on all of our comments.

20 You know, I think the Committee, you know, some prefer B,  
21 some preferred A, and I just tried to capture everybody's comments.  
22 And because we're proposing, or we're sending both to Council for  
23 review and, you know, this is what we liked, and also, we're  
24 challenged by with both, you know, both proposals. So, just giving  
25 them that information.



1           Just sort showing our thoughts (inaudible) our  
2     conversations. And it was helpful for me to just sort of break it  
3     down, you know, based on our conversations. So, that's - I was not  
4     looking at it through, you know, Dennis' eye which, you know, I  
5     respect. But that, that's why I put it together that way.

6           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: So, so, why don't we do - here's what  
7     I'm thinking now. Why don't we leave box four under Option A, which,  
8     which redistrib- -- see, I don't - it re- -- I don't know that it does  
9     do it more evenly, that's the problem. But it does redistribute  
10    population over more wards.

11           You could say, "Redistributes population over more wards",  
12    and then keep bringing the Hispanic population to the same percentage  
13    over our community from 41.21 to 43.16. 'Cause that was clearly  
14    something that was important to the Committee, okay?

15           Then take out the business - the second - the next box is  
16    really just - it is. It's a repeat now of the box above. And the box  
17    below, I don't know that we want to talk about packing, okay?

18           Then you would leave - so, that, that would - yeah. That  
19    would look like that. Then, "Moves more residents, affecting those  
20    in four -," okay. Then, we'd go over to Option B, and we've made the  
21    edits there in the pluses column. In the, in the minus column, I, I,  
22    I just don't think it's-

23           VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Yeah.

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. That doesn't redistribute the  
2 population as even equitably as Option A, you can say doesn't, doesn't  
3 redistribute as (inaudible)

4 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: "The population across as many wards."

5 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. Yeah. It doesn't redistribute  
6 the population across as many wards. That would be fine.

7 MS. CANADY: And then delete the next two.

8 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. And then - no, no. I would  
9 leave the one that says - you could add, "Does not increase Hispanic  
10 population in Ward 3," but I don't, I don't know that you really need  
11 to say that. You've already basically said it over, and -

12 MS. CANADY: Yeah.

13 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: - it's a plus in the other.

14 MS. CANADY: Yes.

15 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: And then take out the "packing".

16 MS. CANADY: Yes.

17 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. So, take out that box and that  
18 box.

19 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: The only reason I'm thinking about  
20 keeping - and I don't have a strong feeling. I completely agree with  
21 the packing one.

22 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

23 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I think we tried to match kind of like  
24 what are the differences and (inaudible)

25 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Right. Right.

1 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Having that word "three Hispanic  
2 population" is still under does match (inaudible) (sic)

3 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. So, what are you -

4 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: - difference between (inaudible)

5 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yes. So, what you could do is in the  
6 box above, 'cause that's where it is on the other side, doesn't  
7 redistribute probably as many wards.

8 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Does not bring the Hispanic -

9 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Does not - yeah.

10 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: - population -

11 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: "Does not bring, does not bring the  
12 Hispanic population in Ward 3 up from 41.21 to 43.16." Yeah, just -

13 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Yeah. I agree. I think it's helpful.  
14 I'm sure the (inaudible)

15 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. Okay. "As many wards." And  
16 then - so, that's fine. Now don't, don't, don't, don't, don't move  
17 the pluses there unless - 'cause we want to leave that box, but we  
18 also want to, I guess re-emphasize in the delta box on the Option B  
19 the same language.

20 It is the same language, if you can move it without moving  
21 it, as they say. "Doesn't bring the Hispanic population (inaudible)"  
22 Yeah, okay. We'll see. Ah, those people are so good with this stuff.  
23 Okay. So, so, just - it, it wouldn't be, -

24 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: (Inaudible)

25 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: - it wouldn't be (inaudible)

1 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: We could take the last (inaudible) and  
2 split precincts, which is a plus for Option B. We could put in a  
3 delta for Option A that it does not combine what precincts.

4 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay.

5 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I mean if we're trying to (inaudible)  
6 (Multiple speakers. Inaudible conversation.)

7 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. And then, and then - so, back  
8 to that one you just moved, just to make the language right. It  
9 should say, "Doesn't redistribute the population across as many wards.  
10 Does not bring the -," and then just say, "Does not bring the Hispanic  
11 population -."

12 (Mumbling.) Period. Period. You don't need from 41- --  
13 yeah. You don't need that from 41.21 to 43.16, 'cause that's already  
14 in the other one. Just period - "community". That's it.

15 Okay. Okay. And then, and then by taking that out, it  
16 really brings up the other boxes, which I think is actually really  
17 helpful. And it's just the facts and they can see and figure it out  
18 for themselves.

19 Okay. Editing. What fun. Okay. Anybody have anything  
20 else on that, or on this at all? I think it looks pretty good.  
21 Charlene?

22 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I'm just reading through it one more  
23 time. It's the English teacher in me.

24 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: (Inaudible)

1 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I think it - I don't see additional  
2 things I - I'm not noticing anything right now.

3 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. All right. So, Roger, if we  
4 vote to send this to the Committee, or to the Council, are we done?

5 MR. RANDOLPH: So, if you're - if you are comfortable with  
6 what you have provided and done here, and you vote to send this to  
7 Council, allowing us to make any stylistic changes that may be  
8 necessary, just as we go back through and reproof it to make sure that  
9 it's spelled correctly and we're not missing anything. But we would  
10 never, we would not, at that point in time, change anything other than  
11 clerical.

12 Then we would put one final statement in the recommendation  
13 that on this date, the, the Committee voted, by a vote of whatever, to  
14 forward this recommendation to Mayor and Council. And we would do  
15 that simply because you're not gonna have an opportunity to sign like  
16 we would normally actually have you sign the document.

17 But under the situation we're under, that would be a little  
18 bit difficult to do, and an electronic signature wouldn't really do  
19 much different than just merely making a statement (inaudible) we  
20 would add that statement that the Committee voted to forward this  
21 recommendation.

22 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay.

23 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Marion, your hand up?

24 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: I'm sorry. Marion?

25 MS. CHUBON: No.

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay.

2 MS. CHUBON: Sorry.

3 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Hand, hand, hand down. I don't even  
4 know how to use the hand, so, okay. Anybody else.

5 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Just a comment that I was thinking  
6 about as we were working through this, which is that I really  
7 appreciate everybody's thinking and intention, and just wanted -

8 The Census point is one we've talked about a lot, and one  
9 that I didn't really think about until we were talking today, and I  
10 was looking at things today, is that I think the Census and the  
11 changes might be more significant at that time.

12 But I also know that, you know, we also have a City  
13 election coming up in 2021, at least, unless the State Legislature  
14 changes that, or whoever - you know, like I think it's important. You  
15 know, we're talking about a percentage here, two percentage there, and  
16 in some ways it isn't very significant.

17 But I'm also really thinking about the fact that there are  
18 constraints in what we can do and how we can move things and what  
19 percentage of people. And I don't want to make it seem like either of  
20 these options have negligible changes, right?

21 I think we're talking about enfranchising voters and making  
22 sure that there is, you know, representation across our city. And  
23 just because wards have been how they are, doesn't mean that they  
24 should always stay that way.

1           So, I really appreciate the different approaches we're  
2 taking and giving the Council and the Mayor two strong options with  
3 different benefits. And I don't want to call them disadvantages, but  
4 benefits and, you know, nothing is perfect.

5           But we're giving them, I think, two really good options to  
6 consider, and making sure that we're doing so by having thought  
7 through it in a lot of different kinds of ways. And incremental teams  
8 do make a big difference towards equity.

9           You know, there's - I just also finished teaching a letter  
10 (sic) from a Birmingham jail where Martin Luther King talks about, you  
11 know, that one of his frustrations was always the incrementalists  
12 (sic), and that it's just a little bit at a time when there's these  
13 really big problems we're trying to deal with.

14           And while I agree with him in his time and place, I also  
15 think there's something to be said for incremental change. And, you  
16 know, it's important because, again, we're talking about  
17 representation on Council and people's access to help from ward  
18 offices.

19           And I just appreciate how carefully we've thought about it,  
20 and not just made a calculation on a calculator to solve a problem.  
21 So, thank you. And little changes can make a big difference over  
22 time.

23           CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Right. Yeah. Incrementalism is  
24 under-valued. Okay. We've got a -

25           MR. RANDOLPH: Mr. -

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah, go ahead, Roger.

2 MR. RANDOLPH: Mr. Mayor, we, we do have the clean version  
3 that we can display to the Committee and they can take a look at it.  
4 We spent a lot of time on the, the chart. There was also some  
5 language following the chart that was added. So, we'll want you to  
6 look at that as well.

7 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. Well, show us where that is,  
8 the charge that was added, 'cause I think we're -

9 MR. RANDOLPH: So, -

10 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: We can -

11 MR. RANDOLPH: - this is, this is the clean version of the  
12 chart.

13 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Right. Yup. Goes - should go down a  
14 little more 'cause there's Ward 6, yeah.

15 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Mr. Mayor, this is Dennis.

16 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

17 MR. McLAUGHLIN: On the, on the - I'm sorry. In Ward - in  
18 the Option A boxes, -

19 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

20 MR. McLAUGHLIN: - I guess I'm just confused about - should  
21 - in the last box, should there be a reference to a particular ward on  
22 the 41 to 43? I'm confused.

23 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: There should be. Yeah, there should  
24 be. And then we just - thanks, Dennis. It should say, "Decreases to  
25 minor population." (Inaudible) should say in Ward 6, yeah. Thanks,



1 Dennis, that's a good catch. Okay. So, where's that charge language  
2 you're talking about, Roger?

3 MR. RANDOLPH: In the two paragraphs following the chart.

4 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Oh.

5 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: That was a comment - this is Charlene.  
6 That was a comment I made more for our discussion. I don't, -

7 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

8 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I don't know that it necessarily  
9 belongs on - I don't mind if it stays here, personally, but I also  
10 don't know that it necessarily belongs here. I just wanted to make  
11 sure that was part of our discussion today.

12 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. I, I, I think I would not add  
13 those. They're kind of editorial comments. They're not in a - I  
14 would take them out. Okay. The conclusion. We thank the (inaudible)  
15 that's who we are. Boom. We send this thing to the Committee. Okay.  
16 Let's go -

17 MR. RANDOLPH: So, right, right before Section 5 is where  
18 we would put in the, the, the vote from this evening's meeting.

19 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. Well, we have to do that. All  
20 right. Let's vote on whether we want to forward this report -

21 MR. RANDOLPH: Okay.

22 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: - that we're looking at to the Mayor  
23 and Council. I'll take a motion from anybody.

24 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Mr. Mayor, this is Dennis.

25 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

1 MR. McLAUGHLIN: I'm the slow child. I, I'm still not sure  
2 on that box that it's saying what I'm thinking it's saying. Sorry.

3 MALE SPEAKER: I think I see what he's talking about where  
4 - are you saying it has to specify, we should specify Ward 3?

5 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Yeah. "Brings the Hispanic population to  
6 the same percentage".

7 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Oh, I see. Okay. You're right on  
8 all of them.

9 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Shouldn't it be one of the wards?

10 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. Okay. You're right. So, on  
11 each of them - okay, I was just assuming that. In each of them, like  
12 you go up, it should say - well, we did that on all of them.

13 MR. McLAUGHLIN: So, -

14 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: All right.

15 MR. McLAUGHLIN: - should it be in, in Ward 3, same -

16 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Well, (inaudible)

17 MR. McLAUGHLIN: - percentage?

18 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: It should say in Ward 1, it should  
19 say in Ward 3, it should say in Ward 5. We didn't do it on any of  
20 them, "increase". So, so, go down to the next box, it should say, "In  
21 Ward 3." Go down to the next box, the second one, it should say, "In  
22 Ward 5." And then if you go across, it's the same thing. "Increases  
23 (inaudible) vote in Ward 5."

24 MR. McLAUGHLIN: But -

25 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: And then down, and then the last -

1 MR. McLAUGHLIN: (Inaudible) Sorry. It would work.

2 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Do you, do you see anything else?

3 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Well, I'm just wondering in the pluses.  
4 So, we're back up to the pluses. Option A, fourth, fourth box down,  
5 left side.

6 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. Yeah.

7 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Should there be a ward in there?

8 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Oh.

9 MALE SPEAKER: Yeah. 'Cause it doesn't specify a ward.

10 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Yeah.

11 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: You're right. You're right. You're  
12 right. God, you are a good editor. (Inaudible) Hispanic to the same  
13 percentage. (Inaudible) In Ward - I think of the - can we just say,  
14 "In Ward 3 is after 43.16.? "Bring the Hispanic to the same  
15 percentage (inaudible) Ward 3." I don't think -

16 MR. McLAUGHLIN: (Inaudible)

17 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: I don't -

18 MR. McLAUGHLIN: - in Ward 3 is overall community.

19 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. I don't, I, I don't know that  
20 it - it redistributes 5 (inaudible)

21 MR. McLAUGHLIN: (Inaudible)

22 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. I think you can say "not more  
23 evenly". It redistributes population over more wards. Yeah. See,  
24 all you do is take the word "more evenly".

25 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Okay.

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. Re- --

2 MR. McLAUGHLIN: But then - yeah. "Bring the Hispanic in  
3 Ward 3 to the same percentage as overall."

4 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. I think 'cause that meets -  
5 then, if you go the deltas on the other side, doesn't redistribute  
6 across as many wards. Does not bring - yeah. Yeah, that's right.  
7 God dang.

8 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Is everybody else okay with that?

9 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah. You - Dennis, did you go to  
10 some like really good school or something? I think he did.

11 MR. McLAUGHLIN: I had Cath- -- I had - I was in the era  
12 of, of Catholic school English teachers. So, we're, you know -

13 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Yeah.

14 MR. McLAUGHLIN: - careful.

15 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: There you go.

16 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Gotta be careful.

17 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Careful's good.

18 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Yeah.

19 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. All right. So, with that, I,  
20 I - we - I actually had asked for a motion and Dennis interrupted.  
21 We're gonna go back and ask -

22 MR. McLAUGHLIN: Yes.

23 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: - for a motion.

24 MR. McLAUGHLIN: My apologies.

1 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: No problem, you did a good - that was  
2 good. All - somebody give me a motion to approve this piece of paper.

3 MR. PERKINS: This is Glenn Perkins. I motion that we, we  
4 send this as is.

5 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: All right. There's a - get a second?

6 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I second.

7 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. I've got a motion and second.  
8 Glenn.

9 MR. SCOTT: Grady Scott second the motion.

10 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: God dang it. Where were these guys  
11 all along? Hold on. I want to go back. Glenn, Grady, I was kind of  
12 assuming you guys weren't here, 'cause I didn't - but you're here. Is  
13 there anything - are you - you followed all of it. Are both of you  
14 good -

15 MR. SCOTT: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: - with what we've done.

17 MR. RANDOLPH: They were on for most of the discussion.

18 MR. SCOTT: Totally.

19 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay.

20 MR. SCOTT: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Grady's there. Glenn, you're good?

22 MR. PERKINS: Yeah. I, I think everything looks fine.

23 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Great. That makes me feel better  
24 that we have seven. Okay. Got a motion and a second. All in favor  
25 say "aye".

1 (Affirmative.)

2 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Any "nays"? No "nays". All right.  
3 So, you've got your vote. Roger, it says here "next steps". I guess  
4 you've explained the next steps.

5 MR. RANDOLPH: Yes, sir.

6 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Are we to meet - there's no - this is  
7 the end of our work for this year?

8 MR. RANDOLPH: Yes, sir, Your Honor. This will take the  
9 Committee's work to the Mayor and Council now. I would like to  
10 personally thank each of you for taking the time to do this.

11 I know it's fast, hard process to get through all of this,  
12 and it was very enjoyable working with you, and seeing the commitment  
13 that you took and the interest that you took from this process.

14 Hopefully, two years from now when we go back through this  
15 again, the Mayor and Council will consider placing you back on the  
16 Committee and continue the work that you started here. Thank you very  
17 much.

18 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: But, but then, but then we have to  
19 agree to come back, too. Anyway, -

20 MR. RANDOLPH: Yes, sir, you do.

21 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: It's my understanding that we can't  
22 serve on the Committee again in two years.

23 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Roger.

24 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Only every -

25 MR. RANDOLPH: I believe that's (inaudible)

1 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: - four years.

2 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Holy moly. All right. We were the  
3 second choice for the big one in two years. Anyway, I want to thank  
4 all of you, too. It was - this isn't, you know, it's, it's, it's,  
5 it's not hard, but there are all sorts of issues that are really big  
6 issues that you, you sort of begin to address in this.

7 And, and I think everybody did it in good spirit and, you  
8 know, in a, in a good tone and tenor. So, so, I, I really appreciate  
9 that. So, anyway I just want to thank all of you, too for doing this.

10 And we will see what the Council - we can, we can watch and  
11 see how Council reacts. I think they will be appreciable for the work  
12 we did, though, for sure. Okay. If there's nothing else, motion  
13 adjourn? That's - you can't make a motion, Ms. Stash.

14 MS. STASH: I was just waving "bye".

15 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay.

16 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: I move to adjourn.

17 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Okay. I'll second it. All in favor  
18 say "aye".

19 (Affirmative.)

20 VICE-CHAIR MENDOZA: Thanks.

21 CHAIRMAN ROTHSCHILD: Perfect. All right. Thanks  
22 everybody. Have a good night.

23 (Casual conversation. Meeting was adjourned.)

I hereby certify that, to the best of my ability, the foregoing is a true and accurate transcription of the original tape-recorded conversation in the case referenced on page 1 above.

Transcription Completed: 10/28/2020

/s/ Kathleen R. Krassow  
KATHLEEN R. KRASSOW - Owner  
M&M Typing Service





# City of Tucson Redistricting Advisory Committee

## Legal Action Report

**Monday, October 19, 2020**

MEETING NOTE: Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, this meeting was conducted using measures to protect public health. This meeting was held remotely through Microsoft Teams, and did not include any items that involved time set aside for public comments. Attendance was allowed by internet link or phone call as indicated on the meeting agenda.

### 1. Roll Call

The Redistricting Advisory Committee (RAC) meeting was called to order at 5:05 p.m. by Chair Jonathan Rothschild.

Upon roll call, those present and absent were:

Present:

Charlene Mendoza, Vice Chair  
Michael O’Connell  
Marion Chubon  
Glenn Perkins  
Kelly Anne Canady  
D. Grady Scott  
Jonathan Rothschild, Chair

Appointor:

Mayor  
Ward 1  
Ward 2  
Ward 3 (arrived at 5:15 p.m.)  
Ward 4  
Ward 5 (arrived at 5:09 p.m.)  
Ward 6

Absent:

None

Staff Present:

Roger W. Randolph, City Clerk  
Suzanne Mesich, Chief Deputy City Clerk  
Maria Talamante, Assistant City Clerk  
Yolanda Lozano, Assistant City Clerk  
Shawna Lee, City Records Manager  
Randy Hammel, Systems Analyst, City Clerk’s Office  
Ana Marrufo, Management Assistant, City Clerk’s Office  
Dennis P. McLaughlin, Principal Assistant City Attorney  
Jennifer Stash, Principal Assistant City Attorney

**2. Approval of Meeting Transcript – October 12, 2020**

It was moved by Michael O’Connell, duly seconded and passed by a roll call vote of 5 to 0 (Glenn Perkins and D. Grady Scott absent), to approve the transcript of the meeting held on October 12, 2020.

**3. Recommendation of Redistricting Options for Mayor and Council Consideration**

(Note: D. Grady Scott arrived at 5:09 p.m.; Glenn Perkins arrived at 5:15 p.m.)

Discussion ensued regarding wording and information to include in the Committee’s recommendation to Mayor and Council.

It was moved by Glenn Perkins, duly seconded and carried by a voice vote of 7 to 0, to approve the recommendation as edited, with the City Clerk’s Office to make additional stylistic changes as necessary.

No further action was taken.

**4. Next Steps**

Information was provided by Roger W. Randolph, City Clerk.

No formal action was taken.

**5. Adjournment**

It was moved by Marion Chubon, duly seconded and carried by a voice vote of 7 to 0, to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:51 p.m.